

Is Holothuria tubulosa the golden goose of ecological aquaculture in the Mediterranean Sea?

Bastien Sadoul, Jean-Philippe Caprioli, Chloé Barrier-Loiseau, Nicolas Cimiterra, Thierry Laugier, Franck Lagarde, Killian Chary, Myriam Callier, Marine-Océane Guillermard, Emmanuelle Roque d'Orbcastel

▶ To cite this version:

Bastien Sadoul, Jean-Philippe Caprioli, Chloé Barrier-Loiseau, Nicolas Cimiterra, Thierry Laugier, et al.. Is Holothuria tubulosa the golden goose of ecological aquaculture in the Mediterranean Sea?. Aquaculture, 2022, 554, pp.738149. 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2022.738149. hal-03656470

HAL Id: hal-03656470 https://hal.umontpellier.fr/hal-03656470v1

Submitted on 22 Jul 2024

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

- 1 Is Holothuria tubulosa the golden goose of ecological aquaculture in the Mediterranean
- 2 Sea?
- 3 Bastien Sadoul^{ab}, Jean-Philippe Caprioli^c, Chloé Barrier-Loiseau^{a,c}, Nicolas Cimiterra^a, Thierry
- 4 Laugier^a, Franck Lagarde^a, Killian Chary^d, Myriam D. Callier^e, Marine-Océane Guillermard^f,
- 5 Emmanuelle Roque d'orbcastel ^{a,g*}
- ⁶ ^a MARBEC, Univ Montpellier, CNRS, Ifremer, IRD, Sète, France
- 7 ^b DECOD (Ecosystem Dynamics and Sustainability), Institut Agro, Ifremer, INRAE, Rennes, France
- 8 ^c Ferme Marine de Campomoro, Tralavettu, 20110 Propriano, France
- 9 ^dWageningen University, Department of Animal Sciences, Wageningen, Netherlands
- 10 ^e MARBEC, Univ Montpellier, CNRS, Ifremer, IRD, Palavas-les-Flots, France
- 11 ^f ITAVI, 7 Rue du Faubourg Poissonnière, 75009 Paris, France
- 12 ^g IOC, Indian Ocean Commission, Blue Tower, Rue de l'Institut, Ebène, Maurice
- 13 * Corresponding author emmanuelle.roque@ifremer.fr
- 14

15 Abstract

16 The use of detritivores under sea farms is a promising avenue to mitigate the benthic impacts 17 of marine fish farms. Sea cucumbers are interesting candidates for integrated multi-trophic 18 aquaculture (IMTA) due to their prevalence in the marine environment, their diversified diet 19 and their economic value. Yet limited information is available regarding their capacities to be 20 stocked and reared underneath aquaculture cages and the associated effects on their survival, 21 growth rate and body composition. This study focused on Holothuria tubulosa, a 22 Mediterranean sea cucumber species candidate for rearing in the vicinity to marine fish cages. 23 We investigated its potential for co-culture on the seabed more or less influenced by marine 24 fish cages. The farm's waste footprint was predicted using a dispersion model 25 (NewDEPOMOD) to estimate the farm's influence along a transect where we also sampled 26 sediment at four distances from the cages (0 m, 25 m, 100 m from the cages, plus a reference

27 site at 150 m). Organic composition of the sediment was analysed (TOC, TON, TOP, OM, stable isotope signature) and linked to the results from the dispersion model. Based on the model 28 29 simulation, the maximum flux of matter reached almost 17 kg solids.m⁻².year⁻¹ below the 30 cages, and gradually decreased with distance from the cages. An isotopic gradient was also 31 found in the sediments according to the distance from the farm, with an enrichment in δN^{15} 32 and a depletion in δC^{13} with increasing proximity to the farm. In parallel we investigated the 33 response of adult sea cucumbers placed at varying distances from the fish cages for a period 34 of one month, measuring their proximate composition, isotopic concentration, and fatty acid 35 and protein composition. We found that despite good survival, growth was null over the 36 experiment. While the isotope signature of the sea cucumbers was significantly affected by 37 distance from the cage, this did not follow the pattern found in sediment. There was a clear 38 difference in fatty acid composition between sites, with sea cucumbers closer to the cages 39 having lower levels of short-chain fatty acids. The protein content was also lower in sea 40 cucumbers reared right below the cages. These results suggest that while adult H. tubulosa 41 can survive the environmental conditions below marine aquaculture cages, they do not 42 nutritionally benefit from fish waste over short periods in the stocking conditions we tested. 43 Their use in IMTA requires further investigation to find optimal stocking conditions.

Key words: detritivores, sea cucumber, integrated multi-trophic aquaculture, isotopes, fatty
 acids, organic footprint

46

47 **1. Introduction**

Detritivores have a crucial role in terrestrial ecosystem processes, as their presence avoids
 biotic detritus accumulation and facilitates nutrient cycling and further primary production
 (Schowalter, 2016). Their role is also central in marine ecosystems through their bioturbation

activities, as they can enhance microbial processes that play a major role in organic matter
 decomposition, mineralization and nutrient production (Göltenboth, 2006).

Among marine detritivores, sea cucumbers (*Echinodermata: Holothuroidea*) are vital members of benthic communities and are present all over the world. They have multiple ecological roles including (a) sediment bioturbation, (b) remediating organic load (Costa et al., 2014), (c) enhancing the productivity of benthic biota (e.g. seagrass, Costa et al., 2014, Wolkenhauer et al., 2010), (d) buffering against ocean acidification, (e) hosting more than 200 symbionts, and (f) acting as food sources for many animals, including humans (Purcell et al., 2016).

60 Sea cucumbers can have high economic value (Purcell et al., 2018). They are mostly exploited 61 for food, principally in Asia, with body integument the main targeted product, which is dried, 62 boiled, salted or cooked (Conand, 1990). Other food by-products such as fermented intestines 63 and dried gonads are marketed in Japan, Korea and China (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). In 64 East Asia, sea cucumbers are also used as traditional medicine to treat a number of conditions 65 (Pangestuti and Arifin, 2018; Xue et al., 2015), including arthritis and joint pain. Scientific 66 studies confirming the presence of a range of bioactive compounds in sea cucumbers have 67 more recently attracted the attention of the pharmaceutical sector (Kiew and Don, 2012). 68 Their saponins have been found to have anti-inflammatory and anti-cancer properties 69 (Pangestuti and Arifin, 2018), and other molecules have been described as having antibacterial 70 (Santos et al., 2016) and antifungal properties (Hamel and Mercier, 1997). Sea cucumbers are 71 also used in certain cosmetics, including liniment, soap and toothpaste. Depending on the 72 species, the selling price can vary dramatically, with some reaching more than 1000 s,kg⁻¹ (e.g. 73 Apostichopus japonicus and Holothuria scabra, Conand, 2017), which has resulted in strong

fishing pressure to supply expanding international demand. It is estimated that 200 million sea cucumbers are extracted from marine ecosystems every year (Purcell et al., 2013; Tanzer et al., 2015) and provide an important source of income to many coastal fishermen, but are consequently threatened by overfishing (FAO, 2008). The development of sea cucumber aquaculture could provide a solution to meet commercial demand on one hand, while equally facilitating conservation by allowing the restocking of some species.

80 In aquaculture systems, particulate wastes, including the faeces of fish and uneaten feed, 81 settle in the vicinity of farms, potentially unbalancing the benthic environment once ecological 82 carrying capacity is exceeded (Hargrave et al., 1997; 2008). This accumulation of organic 83 matter is a major environmental stressor which can induce anoxic zones and increases 84 pathogen pressure, therefore having an impact on the health of both farmed animals and the 85 environment (Chopin et al., 2012; Dauda et al., 2019; Granada et al., 2016; Troell et al., 2009). 86 The organic footprint of an aquaculture farm can be evaluated through environmental 87 sampling or modelled using particle dispersion models such as KK3D, AWATS, or DEPOMOD 88 (Cromey et al., 2012; Dudley et al., 2000; Jusup et al., 2009; Riera et al., 2017).

89 Aquaculture effluents also stimulate biological activity, with organisms of different trophic 90 strategies aggregating in and around cage facilities to consume the waste (Ballester-Molto et 91 al., 2017; Callier et al., 2013; 2018). Integrated multi-trophic aquaculture (IMTA), which co-92 cultivates species from different trophic levels, has been put forward as a potential tool to 93 mitigate aquaculture footprint (Chopin et al., 2012). Systems including detritivorous species 94 such as sea cucumbers, capable of consuming aquaculture waste material (Nelson et al., 95 2012), have been successfully combined with many species. For example, associations have 96 been tested between sea cucumber and sea urchin (Holothuria tubulosa as extractive species

and *Paracentrotus lividus* as primary species, Grosso et al., 2021) or between sea cucumber
and fish such as *Sebastes melanops* and *Apostichopus japonicus* (Park et al., 2015), *Anoplopoma fimbria* and *Parastichopus californicus* (Hannah et al., 2013), *Sciaenops ocellatus*and *Isostichopus badionotus* (Felaco et al., 2020), *Dicentrarchus labrax* and *Holothuria forskali*(MacDonald et al., 2013), and *Dicentrarchus labrax* or *Sparus aurata* and *Holothuria tubulosa*(Neofitou et al., 2019; Tolon et al., 2017a,b).

103 The most common sea cucumber species in the Mediterranean are H. tubulosa, H. forskalii 104 and H. poli (Ocana and Sanchez Tocino, 2005). Of these, the deposit feeder H. tubulosa 105 (Gmelin, 1790) is the most widespread. Over the last decades, this species has been 106 increasingly harvested in the Mediterranean due to growing consumer demand in Asia, with 107 illegal fishing more and more frequently reported (Meloni and Esposito, 2018). Aquaculture 108 research has demonstrated successful results for the artificial reproduction and larval rearing 109 of *H. tubulosa* (Rakaj et al., 2017; Tolon et al., 2017b). However, little is known about their 110 capacities to survive, and grow on fish effluents in proximity to aquaculture marine cages, and 111 nothing is available on consequences on their body composition and consequently nutritional 112 value.

The aim of this study was to use biometric and biochemical measures to explore whether *H. tubulosa* can benefit from fish farm waste when stocked at sites under different levels of influence from marine aquaculture cages, identified using a deposition model. We hypothesized that (a) *H. tubulosa* placed underneath fish cages would assimilate waste from the farm, that (b) the distance to the farm would influence *H. tubulosa* isotopic composition proportionally to the organic matter content in the sediment; and that (c) specific fatty acids and higher protein content would be found in individuals in proximity to the farm. To test

120 these hypotheses, over a period of one month, we first identified sites more or less affected 121 by fish cages using the dispersion model DEPOMOD, then stocked *H. tubulosa* on the seabed 122 along a transect starting from the aquaculture cages and analysed isotopic values (δ^{15} N and 123 δ^{13} C) in the sediment and in sea cucumbers as tracers of fish waste. Complementary analyses 124 of protein content and fatty acid composition in sea cucumbers were performed to obtain 125 information on *H. tubulosa*'s capacity to assimilate a new source of food in an IMTA context.

126

2. Material and methods

127

2.1 Study site and characteristics

128 The study was conducted in the bay of Campomoro (Gulf of Valinco, southern Corsica, France), 129 which since 1992 has hosted a marine fish farm producing 150 tonnes of organic sea bass and 130 sea bream each year. The bay is around 1.2 km wide with a maximum depth of 65 m. The two 131 species are reared in separate cages from a body weight of 5 g to a commercial size of 500 g. 132 The farm had 32 square cages (6 x 6 x 9 m, WxLxH) and 2 round cages (16 x 17m, DxH). The 133 fish were fed every day by hand with an organic commercial diet from Gouessant or Skretting. 134 The farm's biological data (feed composition, feed quantity, fish species, fish biomass) were 135 provided by the farm.

136

2.2 Modelling of farm waste deposition

The organic footprint of the farm was modelled using NewDEPOMOD software (v1.3.1patch02, SAMS). NewDEPOMOD is a lagrangian particle dispersion model structured in four modules (i) grid generation, (ii) particle tracking, (iii) resuspension, and (iv) benthic fauna response (benthic impacts).

141 The grid generation module allows to generate a grid domain based on bathymetry data and 142 cage positions and dimensions. Bathymetry data at an initial resolution of 111m were

extracted from the SHOM database (SHOM, 2015) and interpolated using the kriging method
in ArcGIS software (v.10.6.1) to obtain 10m x 10m resolution data. These bathymetry data
were then imported in NewDEPOMOD to create a grid for the entire bay of Campomoro. Cages
layout and positions were communicated by the farm and entered in NewDEPOMOD.

147 The particle tracking module calculates particle waste emission using farm rearing data and 148 describes their transport from the surface to the seabed based on current and particle settling 149 velocities. Solid waste emissions for sea bream and sea bass stocks were calculated in the 150 particle tracking module based on the stocking density and feeding ratios. Default waste 151 composition (Percentage of carbon in faeces composition 30%, Percentage of carbon in feed 152 49%, Percentage of water in feed composition 9%) and feed digestibility (Percentage of feed 153 absorbed by fish 85%, Default specific feeding rate - mass of feed in kg as a percentage of 154 biomass in kg 0.7%) data of the software were used. A value of 3% unconsumed feed was 155 assumed, based on previous studies (Cromey et al., 2002; 2012). Faeces settling velocities 156 parameters were set as lognormal distribution with a mean of 0.7 cm.s⁻¹ and 0.48 cm.s⁻¹ and 157 a distribution of 0.83 and 0.47 for seabass and seabream respectively (Magill et al., 2006). No 158 information on the settling velocity of feed pellets was available, so the software's default 159 value was used: a uniform distribution at 9.5 cm.s⁻¹. Current fields over the entire water 160 column were measured at the farm from 24 September to 24 October 2019 using an acoustic 161 current meter (3D-ADCP, WorkHorse Sentinel 600 kHz Teledyne®). The current meter was 162 placed 2 m from the cages at the extreme offshore end of the farm and recorded current 163 velocity and directions at a 5 minutes time step. Current velocity data was averaged at each 164 time point over three water layers (0–3 m, 7–10 m and 17–20 m) representative of the surface, 165 middle and bottom of the water column according to Hills et al. (2005) and used as forcing in 166 the particle tracking module, therefore assuming to be the same over the entire grid.

Dominant currents were found to be mostly flowing south/southeast with a velocity generally below 10 cm.s⁻¹. Default values were used for vertical (kz = $0.001 \text{ m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1}$) and horizontal (kx = $0.1 \text{ m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1}$, ky = $0.1 \text{ m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1}$) dispersion coefficients (Cromey et al., 2002; Gillibrand and Turrell, 1997).

The resuspension module is used to describe seabed processes including erosion, transport, deposition and consolidation of the particles on the seabed. NewDEPOMOD's default resuspension parameters were used (Black et al., 2016).

Waste emission and deposition were simulated with NewDEPOMOD over one month, from 24
September to 24 October 2019. The software provided particulate waste deposition fluxes
expressed in g solids.m⁻².year⁻¹ for each cell of the grid. The results were then transferred to
ArcGIS to create the deposition graphs.

178

2.3 Specimen collection

In July 2020, 42 adult specimens of *H. tubulosa* naturally present in the study area were
collected by scuba divers at a depth of 17 m near *Posidonia oceanica* meadows in the bay of
Campomoro, outside the influence of the farm.

182 Before biometric measurements, holothurians (171.4 \pm 64.3 g, mean WW \pm SD) were kept 183 fasted overnight to ensure gut content evacuation, as recommended by Tolon et al. (2017a). 184 They were then anesthetized for 30 minutes in a mixture of menthol and ethanol (5.6 g/L 185 ethanol) diluted in aerated seawater (1 L per 50 L). The body length and diameter (at the 186 largest part) were then measured with a precision of 0.1 mm and 0.01 mm respectively. Wet 187 weight (WW, in g) was measured in a tank filled with clear seawater on a scale with a precision 188 of 0.1 g. Six randomly chosen individuals were then euthanized on ice, opened, and the body 189 wall stored at -20°C for further analyses.

190

2.4 Experimental design

191 Four experimental sites to test the effect of aquaculture waste on sea cucumbers were 192 identified along a transect: site "0" under the cages (20.4 m deep), site "25" at 25 m from the 193 cages (21.3 m deep), site "100" at 98 m from the cages (23 m deep), and the "reference" site 194 (19 m deep), located 250 m northwest of the cages, outside the influence of the farm. At each 195 site, triplicate baskets with a triangular-prism shape and rigid 1-cm mesh (commonly called 196 Australian oyster baskets) were fixed in the sediment. The baskets' length, width and height 197 were respectively 80 cm x 35 cm x 20 cm (effective sediment surface area of 0.28 m⁻²). At the 198 beginning of July 2020, three individuals were placed in each basket.

One month later, the baskets were brought to the surface, and the animals were anesthetized and weighed using the same protocol as at the start of the experiment. They were then euthanized on ice, opened, and the body wall was stored at -20°C until further analyses. In total, 33 animals out of the 36 originally placed in the baskets were recovered. The 3 lost animals (1 at site "reference", and 2 at site "25 m") may have died or escaped during the experiment.

205

2.5 Environmental data

The bottom water temperature (°C) near the experimental infrastructure was recorded at 30minute intervals by an NKE-STPS logger fixed to the infrastructure (from 6 July to 6 August 2020). During the entire experiment, there was a stable water temperature of around 21.7 \pm 1.3°C. At the beginning and the end of the experiment, samples of superficial sediment (1–3 cm) were collected by divers at each site using a corer (diameter 20 mm). Samples (3 cores per site, n = 23*) were kept in the dark and on ice before being frozen and processed within 30 days (ISO, 2004). *One sediment sample (at the end of the experiment and from site
"reference") was partially spilled after being collected and was therefore discarded.

214

2.6 Trophic biomarkers

215 Dry weight (DW) was measured at a precision of 0.1 g after lyophilization for all samples 216 (animals, sediment and fish feed). Lyophilized sea cucumbers (n = 33), sediment (n = 23) and 217 feed (n = 4) were homogenized into powder using a grinder. Powdered samples were 218 combusted in an Integra CN Analyzer and the resultant gases were introduced into a 219 continuous-flow isotope ratio mass spectrometer (SERCON Integra CN) to determine C and N 220 amounts as well as their isotope ratios, according to the procedure described in Raimbault et 221 al. (2008). The stable isotope (SI) data was expressed as the relative difference between 222 samples and standard reference materials as follows:

223
$$\delta X (\%_0) = \left(\frac{R_{sample}}{R_{standard}} - 1\right) \times 10^3$$

where X is ¹³C or ¹⁵N, and R is the ratio of heavy to light isotope ($^{13}C/^{12}C$ or $^{15}N/^{14}N$). ¹⁵N/¹⁴N gives clues about the animal food source and trophic level, upward movement tending to concentrate $\delta^{15}N$ isotopes by 3–4‰ at each stage in the food chain.

The particulate phosphorus was determined by wet oxidation using potassium
persulfate (Raimbault et al., 1999). Carbon (TOC), nitrogen (TON) and phosphorus (TOP) levels
were reported in %.

To further explore sea cucumber biochemical composition, crude protein content was determined according to the Kjeldahl method (N \times 6.25) (Association of Official Analytical Chemists, 2000).

After extraction by acid transmethylation, fatty acid (FA) composition was analysed using gas
 chromatography (Varian CP 8400 GC equipped with a splitless injector and a flame-ionization

detector and using hydrogen as the mobile phase: see Mathieu-Resuge et al., 2020 for details).
Results (mean values ± SD) were reported in % of total protein or FAs and/or in mg.g⁻¹ of
sample dry weight (DW).

238

2.7 Statistical analysis

The results were expressed as mean ± standard deviation. One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was carried out with a parametric Fisher test (F) to determine the differences (in the weight, isotopes, protein and lipids of sea cucumbers and in the organic contents of the sediment) between all conditions (distance from farm: 0 m, 25 m, 100 m and reference site).

A linear model was fitted to explain stable isotope values using the site as an explanatory factorial variable. For sediment values, the sampling time (initial: beginning of experiment; final: end of experiment) and the interaction with the site was also added to the model. Nonsignificant interactions were removed. Post hoc tests were computed using least-squares means (using the "Ismeans" package in R) to compare differences between sites.

- **3. Results**
- 249

3.1 Organic footprint: deposition simulations and particulate matter signature

250 NewDEPOMOD simulations

The deposition of organic matter was estimated to be very localized around the cages, with the deposition of 1000 g of solids.m⁻².year⁻¹ occurring at a geographical limit less than 20 m away from the cages (Fig. 1). Right below the cages, deposition was estimated to reach a maximum of 16 862 g.m⁻².year⁻¹.

For the four sites used in the experiment, simulations from NewDEPOMOD estimated a deposition of 6233.5, 882.8, 96.1 and 3.7 g.m⁻².year⁻¹ for sites "0", "25", "100" and "reference" respectively.

The analysis of the organic contents (TON, TOP, TOC) of the sediment confirmed the gradient simulated by NewDEPOMOD (Fig. 2). All varied significantly according to the distance from the cages – TON (F-value=14.906, df=3, *p*-value=0.002), TOP (F-value=25.358, df=3, *p*value<0.001) and TOC (F-value=5.430, df=3, *p*-value=0.03) – with the highest values below the cages (0 m), indicating a farm footprint concentrated between 0 and 25 m from the cages. The correlation on a log-scale between TOP and NewDEPOMOD results was significant (*p*value<0.001) with a R² of 0.99 (Supplementary Fig. 1).

265

3.2 Stable isotope (SI) signatures

The δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N values obtained for the samples of fish feed were –23.0 ± 0.2‰ and 7.9 ± 266 267 0.5‰ respectively (Fig. 3). The SI composition of sediment showed that δN^{15} varied 268 significantly according to the sampling date (F-value=44.2, df=1, p-value<0.001) and the site 269 (F-value=57.3, df=3, *p*-value<0.001, Fig 3B). No effect of sampling date or site was observed 270 for δ^{13} C. No interaction between sampling date and site was found for δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N, so all 271 samples were illustrated on the same graph to show general trends (Fig. 3A and B). An isotopic 272 gradient was found in sediments according to the distance from the farm, indicating an enrichment in δ^{15} N with increasing proximity to the farm (Fig. 3A). Of the 4 sites, site "0" had 273 the highest mean δ^{15} N value (5.2‰ at final sampling). The correlation (log-based) between 274 sediment $\delta^{15}N$ and NewDEPOMOD results was significant (p-value=0.017) with a R² 0.97 of 275 276 (Supplementary Fig. 2).

277 Concerning the SI signature of *H. tubulosa*, $\delta^{15}N$ was significantly different between sites (F-278 value=4, df=4, *p*-value=0.009) with the "reference" site being significantly higher than site "0" 279 (Fig. 4B). Stable C isotope ratios (δ^{13} C) were not significantly different between sites (Fig. 4A).

280

3.3 Weight, fatty acid profiles and proximate composition of H. tubulosa

At the start of the experiment, the weight of the 36 living individuals was 171.4 ± 64.3 g (mean WW \pm SD). The 6 euthanized individuals weighed 131.5 ± 60.1 g (mean WW \pm SD) and their dry body wall 12.0 ± 3.3 g (mean DW \pm SD). At the end of the experiment, animals weighed 158.76 \pm 95.39g (mean WW \pm SD) and their dry body wall 14.47 \pm 5.80 g (mean DW \pm SD). No significant difference between sites was observed for the final body wall weight and dry weight (Fig. 5a and b).

A significant difference between sites (F-value= 4.201, df=3, p= 0.0364) was observed for protein content (Fig. 6), with higher values for the "reference" site (60.95 ± 1.06%) compared to site "0" (57.09 ± 3.32%).

Regarding the fatty acid profile (Table 1), the total fat content varied between 0.56 and 1.29 µg.mg⁻¹, representing 0.13% of the total composition of the animal. We identified 33 fatty acids (FAs) in *H. tubulosa* samples, with high variability between replicates (Fig. 7). The PCA performed on FA profiles showed that sites differed on the second axis (Fig. 7B). The FAs contributing the most to this difference were the shortest FAs measured (Fig. 7C, 15:0, iso15:0, 16:0, etc.). These are usually also saturated FAs (SFAs) and this translated to the total SFAs increasing with the distance from the cages (Table 1).

Table 1 shows the major classes of FA in the composition of samples, with palmitic acid (16:0),
stearic acid (18:0), dimethyl acetal DMA 18:0 (1,1-Dimethoxyoctadecane) and arachidonic acid
ARA (20:4n-6) being the most commonly found in the animals.

Most FAs in *H. tubulosa* samples were SFAs, representing from 42.4–50.8% of the total. A total of ten monounsaturated fatty acids (MUFAs) were identified: 16:1n-7, 17:1n-x, 18:1n-7, 18:1n-9, 20:1n-7, 20:1n-9, 20:1n-11, 22:1n-7, 22:1n-9 and 24:1n-9. The major MUFA was 20:1n-11, with values that varied between 3.4% and 6.1%. Eight polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFAs) were measured, three belonging to the omega 3 category (16:4n-3, 18:4n-3, 20:5n-3)

and four others to the omega 6 category (16:2n-6, 18:2n-6, 20:2n-6, 20:4n-6). The major PUFA was arachidonic acid (ARA 20:4n-6) with a maximal value of 13.7%. The sum of highly unsaturated fatty acids (HUFAs; fatty acids with \ge 20 carbon chain length and two double bonds, i.e. 20:2n-6, 20:4n-6 and 20:5n-3) varied between 14.4% at 0 m, 11.3% at 25 m, 12.5% at 50 m and 13.1% at 150 m.

- 310 Finally, the sea cucumber FA composition also presented micro-organism markers (Table 2),
- with a gradient that increased from the farm (17.3%, at site "0") to the reference site (22.4%),
- 312 but that was lower at all sites than the proportion found in wild individuals (30.8%).
- 313

4. Discussion

315 Localized aquaculture footprint

316 The deposition simulation and the sediment samplings were performed at two separated 317 seasons, but a good relationship was observed between estimated fluxes and sediment 318 element composition, especially for total organic phosphorus and δ^{15} N values. This link partly 319 validates the modelling outputs. The organic footprint of the fish farm, both through the 320 NewDEPOMOD simulation and through sediment analyses, was found to be very localized, 321 with aquaculture waste settling in the immediate vicinity of the cages (less than 25 m), with a 322 deposition of 1 kg solids.m⁻².year⁻¹ within a geographical limit of less than 20 m from the cages. 323 These deposition fluxes are within the low range of values demonstrated to have ecological impacts in temperate environments (i.e. 0.1 to 10 kg solids m⁻².year⁻¹, reviewed by Keeley et 324 325 al. 2013). An extent of influence of <25 m is consistent with previous studies on the impact of 326 fish farming (Callier et al., 2013; Kutti et al., 2007; Mazolla et al., 2000).

327 Increased δ^{15} N signature of the sediment around cages was expected since fish feed and waste 328 generally have enriched levels of ¹⁵N (Mazzola and Sarà, 2001) as feed contains fish meal and 329 fish oil. This was confirmed by the feed's SI signature (7.9 ± 0.5‰ δ^{15} N). Fish feed is also 330 composed of terrestrial material (e.g. wheat, soja) and generally has lower levels of ¹³C (here 331 confirmed by the δ^{13} C value of $-23.0 \pm 0.2\%$) than other marine sources of organic matter. 332 Therefore δ^{13} C can be used as an effective tracer of fish waste (Callier et al., 2013). In this 333 study, we confirmed SI to be an effective way to trace farm deposition (Vizzini and Mazzola, 334 2004; White et al., 2017), as it showed an isotopic gradient in sediment enrichment in $\delta^{15}N$ 335 with increasing proximity to the farm $(5.2 \pm 0.0\%)$ at final sampling of site "0" compared to 2.6 336 ± 0.1‰ at the reference site).

337 Survival of H. tubulosa below fish cages

338 A prerequisite of the study was to choose an optimal period for rearing H. tubulosa, at a 339 temperature known to be a critical determinant of growth (Hannah et al., 2013). This was the 340 case for the experiment, during which the water temperature was stable in a favourable range 341 of 21.7 \pm 1.3°C. We found that *H. tubulosa* survival was high (91.3%), with only 3 animals 342 missing at the end of the period (2 at site "25" and 1 at site "reference"). These were assumed 343 to have escaped or potentially been eaten by a predator (Pagurus bernhardus was found in 344 great quantities in the corresponding baskets). This survival rate suggests the feasibility of 345 associating *H. tubulosa* as an extractive species in IMTA under fish cages in a Mediterranean 346 context. Nevertheless, we did not observe any weight differences between sites and sampling 347 times. Multiple reasons can explain these negative results. First, the use of adults reduces 348 growth potential, and therefore capacities to observe weight differences over one month. 349 Indeed, although *H. tubulosa* is known to grow much further than the initial weight of our

350 specimen (e.g. ultimate weight of 620 g reported in Aydın, 2019), investment in reproduction 351 and higher somatic maintenance in adults necessarily lower growth compared to juveniles. 352 Consequently, the use of juveniles (although difficult to find in nature) or an increase in the 353 duration of the study would have probably helped getting significant growth, and maybe 354 differences between sites. For example, Costa et al. (2014) were able to get a significant 355 growth (0.89 \pm 0.29% d⁻¹) with juveniles of *H. tubulosa* (between 23.7 and 24.1 g) kept twice 356 as long (60 days), but in laboratory conditions. In open-water, but with another species (H. 357 poli), a recent study also observed significant growth, but low survival, of juveniles over 1 year 358 (Cutajar et al. 2022). Sea cucumbers are stress-sensitive with physiological responses 359 observed in response to environmental changes (Jobson et al., 2021; Hou et al., 2019; Kamyab 360 et al., 2017). Performing a longer experiment allows the sea cucumbers to recover from 361 environmental stress applied and acclimate to the new conditions. We should also 362 acknowledge here the difficulty of getting a reliable wet weight measurement in these species. 363 Along with the random water ejection of alive sea cucumbers, the duration of the fasting 364 period prior measurement is crucial. Here, we applied an overnight fasting period as 365 recommended by Tolon et al., 2017a. Nevertheless, a parallel study (Sadoul et al., to be 366 submitted) showed that the fasting period is temperature-dependent and that 48 hours 367 fasting period ensures complete emptying of the gastrointestinal tract.

368 Consequently, further experiments, with longer periods of (i) starvation before biometrics and
369 (ii) experimentation, would be needed to demonstrate that cucumbers can grow under such
370 IMTA conditions.

371 Stocking density is also known to be a critical determinant of sea cucumber growth (Aydin,
372 2019; Costa et al., 2014). Wild sea cucumbers can be found at densities below 1 individual.m⁻

² (Aydin, 2019). When kept in captivity, densities higher than 15 ind.m⁻² lead to weight loss 373 374 and potentially death, as found with *H. tubulosa* in a prolonged time experiment (Tolon et al., 375 2017b). Similar results were found after keeping Cucumaria frondosa several years 376 downstream from a land-based salmon farm: in that study, individuals lost half of their wet 377 weight (Sun et al., 2020). In our study, for statistical reasons, each basket contained 3 378 individuals, equivalent to a density of 11 ind (or 1700 g).m⁻². This density is in the upper range 379 of what *H. tubulosa* can withstand according to Tolon et al. (2017b), who recommended 6 ind 380 (of 40 g) m⁻².

Further experiments are needed to better understand the relationship between growth,
 density and *H. tubulosa* welfare in an IMTA context.

383 Assimilation of organic fish effluents

We used a double trophic biomarker approach to verify *H. tubulosa*'s ability to assimilate organic fish waste. Stable isotopes have previously been used as trophic markers to investigate sea cucumber ecology (Costa et al., 2014; Slater and Carton, 2010). Coupling biomarkers with fatty acids allows a refined understanding of trophic relationships, especially in polyculture systems (Feng et al., 2014; Mathieu-Resuge et al., 2020). Associating these methods showed differences in sea cucumber composition according to distance from the farm, suggesting differences in food assimilation.

Several studies on other sea cucumber species co-cultivated in IMTA – *A. japonicus* (Park et al. 2015), *C. frondosa* (Sun et al., 2020), *A. mollis* (Slater and Carton, 2007) – have used SI signatures to indicate assimilation of aquaculture waste. We expected a shift in sea cucumber SI signature towards the SI sediment signature, and towards the SI fish feed signature for individuals stocked in the vicinity of fish cages. Based on the trophic enrichment factor (TEF)

396 previously measured for H. tubulosa (Costa et al., 2014), we were expecting a negligible shift 397 in δ^{13} C (0.2±0.2 ‰) but a significant enrichment in δ^{15} N (2.7±0.3 ‰) compared to the 398 sediment. While we did not observe any difference between sea cucumber δ^{13} C according to 399 distance from the farm, surprisingly the δ^{15} N decreased for animals closer to the farm (value 400 deviating from the fish feed δ^{15} N of 7.9 ± 0.5‰). The *H. tubulosa* isotopic pattern was overall 401 the opposite of the sediment isotopic pattern, suggesting that individuals did not assimilate 402 the sediment, and associated organic waste from the farm. It is probable that instead they 403 assimilate lower trophic food, such as bacteria or diatoms growing in the sediment in the 404 vicinity of sea cages, as previously observed in an IMTA context by Hochard et al. (2016).

One explanation of such a pattern can be related to sediment characteristics. Organic matter content and sources (sedimentary, plant or animal material) along with granulometry of sediment are known to play a specific role in sea cucumber feeding behaviour and thus in the ingestion process (Boncagni et al., 2019; Grosso et al., 2021; Mezzali and Soualili, 2013; Ricart et al., 2015; Tolon et al., 2015). According to Boncagni et al. (2019) *H. tubulosa* selectively assimilates food with a preference demonstrated for seagrass detritus in an environment with multiple food sources.

In parallel, Mezali and Soualili (2013) demonstrated *H. tubulosa*'s preference for ingestion of medium sediment fractions (200 to 600 μm). Moreover, mineral and microorganism (benthic microalgae and bacteria) concentrations in the sediment may also play a role in sea cucumber feeding (Hair et al., 2016). Additional studies exploring the sediment characteristics (composition and granulometry) below the cages in more detail would confirm *H. tubulosa*'s ability to grow by assimilating fish waste in an IMTA context. The different potential food sources' contributions (fish waste versus natural resources of the sediment) to the diet of sea

419 cucumbers would also have been of interest following previously published methods
420 (Boncagni et al., 2019; Parnell and Jackson, 2013; Ricart et al., 2015).

421 Finally, we worked with wild specimens collected in the studied bay to avoid any risk of 422 introducing pathogens or undesirable organisms. Only large specimens could be found, which 423 is not ideal because they were probably all already investing energy in reproduction rather 424 than growth. Consequently, the isotope measures performed in the body wall probably might 425 lack the capacities to detect diet switches. Measures in the gonads might have provided 426 different results. This problem could be overcome by using juveniles, as has been 427 demonstrated in an IMTA with P. californicus (Hannah et al., 2013), where small animals (<100 428 g WW) presented high potential to assimilate organic components (grew of 27–56%) while 429 large ones (>100 g) decreased in size by 10–33% over a year. That difference may be due to 430 greater competition for food and space for the latter, or different feeding preferences, with 431 small individuals preferring fine particulate material (Yingst, 1982).

432 Farm effect on biochemical markers of interest

433 Holothurians are nutritionally interesting because of their low fat and high protein content, as 434 well as they contain amino acids and trace elements essential for human health (Chen, 2003). 435 Regarding H. tubulosa's biochemical profile, we confirmed this, finding a protein content of 436 57.1±3.3%, similar than the 60.9±0.3% found by Bilgin and Tanrikulu (2018). Fat content was 437 also low, at 0.13% of the total composition (between 0.56 and 1.29 μ g/mg), lower than the 438 value of 0.76% found by Bilgin and Tanrikulu (2018) for *H. tubulosa* and the value of 0.1–0.9% 439 found for Parastichopus spp. (Chang Lee et al., 1989), and much lower than the fat content of 440 H. forskali (4.8±2.3%, Santos et al., 2016).

441 We identified 33 fatty acids in *H. tubulosa* samples, which is in the same order of magnitude 442 as other species such as *H. forskali* (37 FAs identified in David et al., 2020). The major Fas 443 identified in *H. tubulosa* individuals were SFAs (42.4–50.8%), stearic acid (18:0) and 444 arachidonic acid (20:4n-6) – these were the most commonly found in all samples. Of the SFAs, 445 FA 18:1n9, known to be a tracer of fish feed (Irisarri et al., 2015), was identified. Fish feed 446 increasingly contains plant oils (Sun et al., 2020), which have lower levels of omega-3 PUFAs 447 and higher levels of omega-6 PUFAs (Menoyo et al., 2007). *H. tubulosa* individuals were rich 448 in PUFAs (18%), which are significant for human nutrition. The highest values obtained were 449 for stearic acid C18:0 (25–30%), arachidonic acid C20:4 omega-6 polyunsaturated FA (5–11%) 450 (said to be essential because it is necessary but not synthesized by the human body), palmitic 451 acid C16:0 (6–13%), and eicosapentaenoic acid C 20:5 omega-9 (3–6%). The PUFA content 452 (18%) was lower than other studies on H. tubulosa (36% in Bilgin and Tanrikulu, 2018) or H. 453 forskali (43% in Santos et al., 2016) but similar for FAs of nutritional interest such as 454 arachidonic and eicosapentaenoic acids (19% and 9.1% respectively for H. tubulosa in Bilgin 455 and Tanrikulu, 2018; 20% and 10% respectively for H. forskali in Santos et al., 2016). These 456 discrepancies could be due to the sampling season, which took place in the reproduction 457 period for our study, and in the winter, the period of fat storage, for Santos et al. (2016).

We measured between 11.3% and 14.4% of HUFAs, which are known to be vital for their role in membrane properties and immune response (Twining et al., 2016). Other studies have found HUFA values of 23.2–36.6% in *H. forskali* tissues (David et al., 2020) and 21.8% in the foregut of *H. leucospilota* (Mfilinge and Tsuchiya, 2016).

462 We observed a difference between the four sampling sites in terms of FA content in sea 463 cucumbers, with more FAs observed with increasing distance from the farm. This increase is

464 mostly explained by higher quantities of saturated, branched-chain and shorter fatty acids 465 (below 17C). Many of these FAs were microbial markers (Salvo et al., 2015). Consequently, in 466 contrast to the δ^{15} N isotope results, this suggests that sea cucumbers near sea cages ingested 467 less micro-organisms.

468 **5.** Conclusion

469 This study found that H. tubulosa sea cucumbers can survive in the vicinity of fish cages in a 470 Mediterranean context. However, individuals overall showed decreased protein and lipid 471 content and a reduced isotopic signature when stocked closer to fish cages. This suggests 472 reduced food assimilation during the period of the experiment. Thus, the findings could 473 neither demonstrate that nutrients in aquaculture waste meet the nutritional needs of H. 474 *tubulosa* nor confirm the possibility of developing *H. tubulosa* aquaculture up to commercial 475 size under such conditions. It would be valuable to carry out further experiments to test the 476 cross effects of sediment characteristics on sea cucumber growth in order to test whether, in 477 an IMTA context, fish waste could provide another food source suitable to sustain H. tubulosa 478 survival, growth and reproduction. As seasonal changes in adult physiology influence somatic 479 growth by reducing available energy due to gamete production, we recommend working with 480 juveniles in further research on the association of sea cucumbers in IMTA in order to observe 481 growth in such systems. A priority should be to determine their feeding preferences (i.e. 482 sediment granulometry and composition) and behavioural responses regarding the effect of 483 different stocking densities and captivity on *H. tubulosa* welfare.

484

485 Acknowledgments

486 This research was supported by the project "EPURVAL2" (financed by FEAMP, 2018–2021). 487 We especially thank Maxime Craffk, Laurent Duprat and all the staff of the Campomoro fish 488 farm for their warm welcome, their hospitality, and their help during our stays on the farm. 489 We are also grateful for the expertise of M. Oswald (Upsciences), who performed the protein 490 analyses, F. Legrand (LEMAR), who performed the lipid analyses, and P. Raimbault (MIO), who 491 performed the isotope and N/P/C analyses. We would also like to thank A. Fiandrino (Ifremer, 492 MARBEC) and S. Coudray (Ifremer) for help with the current data acquisition. Finally, many 493 thanks to Elise Bradbury for the English proofreading and reviewers for helping us improving 494 this paper.

495 *Author's contributions:*

496 Gloria Maris, a French aquaculture company and employer of J. P. Caprioli (JPC), generated 497 the initial idea of *H. tubulosa* association with sea farm cages. E. Roque d'orbcastel (ERO) 498 conceived the study with post-doctoral researcher Bastien Sadoul (BS) and ERO wrote the 499 initial draft of the manuscript. ERO and JPC created the IMTA experimental design. ERO, BS, 500 C. Barrier-Loiseau (CBL) and M. Callier (MC) developed the experimental design. ERO, JPC, 501 M.O. Guillermard (MOG), N. Cimiterra (NC), T. Laugier (TL) conducted the experiments, diving 502 to collect the samples and to deploy the current meter and environmental probes. F. Lagarde 503 (FL) prepared the current meter and extracted the current data. ERO, BS, JPC, MOG, NC and 504 CBL performed the biometrics. BS and K. Chary (KC) performed the DEPOMOD simulations. 505 CBL, BS, ERO, MC performed lyophilization and sediment analysis. ERO and BS performed 506 statistical analyses. BS, MC, KC, NC and FL contributed to improve the writings of the initial 507 draft. All authors approved the manuscript submission.

508 **Conflict of Interest statement.** The authors declare that they have no known competing 509 financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work

510 reported in this paper.

- 511 Ethical. Animal handling was performed respecting ethical animal welfare guidelines. The
- 512 number of sea cucumbers sampled was limited to the strictly necessary and received
- 513 authorization from the local authority (order no. 01-2019 of 7 August 2019 authorizing the
- 514 exceptional sampling of *Holothuria tubulosa* for scientific or experimental purposes.)
- 515

516 References

- 517 Association of Official Analytical Chemists, 2000. Official methods of analysis of AOAC 518 international (17th edn). Washington, D.C.: AOAC.
- 519 Aydın, M., 2019. Density and Biomass of Commercial Sea Cucumber Species Relative to Depth
- 520 in the Northern Aegean Sea. Thalassas 35:541–550, 10.1007/s41208-019-00144-4
- 521 Ballester-Moltó, M., Sanchez-Jerez, P., Aguado-Giménez, F., 2017. Consumption of particulate
- 522 wastes derived from cage fish farming by aggregated wild fish. An experimental approach.
- 523 Mar Environ Res 130:166-173 10.1016/j.marenvres.2017.07.014
- Bilgin, Ş., Tanrikulu, H., 2018. The changes in chemical composition of *Holothuria tubulosa*(Gmelin, 1788) with ambient-drying and oven-drying methods. Food Science & Nutrition: 6
 10.1002/fsn3.703
- 527 Black, K., Carpenter, T., Berkeley, A., Black, K.S., Amos, C.L., 2016. Refining sea-bed process 528 models for aquaculture. Scottish Association for Marine Science.
- 529 Boncagni, P., Rakaj, A., Fianchini, A., Vizzini, S., 2019. Preferential assimilation of seagrass 530 detritus by two coexisting Mediterranean sea cucumbers: *Holothuria polii* and *Holothuria* 531 *tubulosa*, Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci., 231, 106464, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2019.106464</u>
- 532 Callier, M., Lefebvre, S., Dunagan, M.K., Bataille. M.P., Coughlan, J., Crowe, T.P., 2013. Shift in
- benthic assemblages and organisms' diet at salmon farms: community structure and stable
 isotope analyses. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 483:153-167, 10.1111/raq.12208
- 535 Callier. M., Byron. CJ, Bengtson DA, Cranford PJ, Cross SF, Focken U, Jansen HM, Kamerman P,
- 536 Kiessling A, Landry T, O'Beirn F, Petersson E, Rheault RB, Strand O, Sundell K, Svasand T,
- 537 Wikfors GH, McKindsey CW (2018) Attraction and repulsion of mobile wild organisms to finfish
- 538 and shellfish aquaculture: a review. Rev Aquac10(4):924-949, <u>10.3354/meps10251</u>
- 539 Chang-Lee MV, Price RJ, Lampila LE (1989) Effect of processing on proximate composition and
- 540 mineral content of sea cucumbers (*Parastichopus spp.*). J Food Sci 54:567–57

- 541 Chary K, Callier MD, Covès D, Aubin J, Simon J, Fiandrino A (2021) Scenarios of fish waste
- 542 deposition at the sub-lagoon scale: a modelling approach for aquaculture zoning and site
- 543 selection, ICES Journal of Marine Science
- 544 Chopin T, Cooper JA, Reid G, Cross S, Moore C, 2012. Open-water integrated multi-trophic
- 545 aquaculture: environmental biomitigation and economic diversification of fed aquaculture by
- 546 extractive aquaculture. Rev Aquac 4:209–220, doi.org/10.1111/j.1753-5131.2012.01074.x
- 547 Conand, C., 1990. The fishery resources of Pacific Island Countries. Part 2: Holothurians. *FAO*548 Fisheries Technical Paper 272(2): 143p. Rome
- 549 Conand, C., 2017. Les holothuries, ressource marine : du mythe à la surexploitation mondiale.
 550 Bulletin N° 271 des amis du Muséum National de l'Histoire Naturelle
- 551 Costa, V., Mazzola, A., Vizzini, S., 2014. *Holothuria tubulosa* Gmelin 1791 (*Holothuroidea*, 552 *Echinodermata*) enhances organic matter recycling in Posidonia oceanica meadows, J. Exp.
- 553 Mar. Biol. Ecol., 461: 226-232, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jembe.2014.08.008
- 554 Cromey, C., Thetmeyer, H., Lampadariou, N., Black, K., Kögeler, J., Karakassis, I., 2012. 555 MERAMOD: predicting the deposition and benthic impact of aquaculture in the eastern 556 Mediterranean Sea. Aquac Environ Interact 2:157–17, <u>DOI:10.3354/aei00034</u>
- 557 Cromey, C.J., Nickell, T.D., Black, K.D., 2002. DEPOMOD—modelling the deposition and
- 558 biological effects of waste solids from marine cage farms. Aquaculture 214: 211–239
- 559 Cutajar, K., Falconer, L., Massa-Gallucci, A., Cox, E.R., Schenke, L., Bardócz, T., Sharman, A.,
- 560 Deguara, S., Telfer, T.C., 2022. Culturing the sea cucumber Holothuria poli in open-water
- integrated multi-trophic aquaculture at a coastal Mediterranean fish farm. Aquaculture 550:
- 562 737881, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2021.737881</u>
- Dauda, A.B., Ajadi, A., Tola-Fabunmi, A.S., Akinwole, A.O., 2019. Waste production in
 aquaculture: Sources, components and managements in different culture systems. Aquac Fish
 4:81–88, doi.org/10.1016/j.aaf.2018.10.002
- David, F., Hubas, C., Laguerre, H., et al, 2020. Food sources, digestive efficiency and resource
 allocation in the sea cucumber *Holothuria forskali* (*Echinodermata: Holothuroidea*): Insights
 from pigments and fatty acids. Aquacult Nutr 26:1568–1583, 10.1111/anu.13103
- 569 Dudley, R.W., Panchang, V.G., Newell, C.R., 2000. Application of a comprehensive modeling
- strategy for the management of net-pen aquaculture waste transport. Aquaculture 187 (34):319-349, 10.1016/s0044-8486(00)00313-6
- FAO, Toral-Granda, V. et al, 2008. Sea cucumbers: a global review of fisheries and trade. Food
 and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture
 Technical Paper. No. 516
- 575 Felaco, L., Olvera-Novoa, M., Robledo, D., 2020. Multitrophic integration of the tropical red 576 seaweed *Solieria filiformis* with sea cucumbers and fish. Aquaculture 527: 735475, 577 DOI:10.1016/j.aquaculture.2020.735475
- 578 Feng, J.X., Gao, Q.F., Dong, S.L., Sun, Z.L., Zhang, K., 2014. Trophic relationships in a polyculture
- 579 pond based on carbon and nitrogen stable isotope analyses: a case study in Jinghai Bay, China.
- 580 Aquaculture 428:258–264, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11802-018-3655-y

- Gianasi, B. L., Hamel, J.-F., Montgomery, E. M., Sun, J., Mercier, A., 2020. Current knowledge
 on the biology, ecology, and commercial exploitation of the sea cucumber *Cucumaria frondosa*. Rev. Fish. Sci. Aquac. doi: 10.1080/23308249.2020.1839015
- 584 Gillibrand, P.A., Turrell, W.R., 1997. Simulating the dispersion and settling of particulate 585 material and associated substances from salmon farms. Report No. 3/97. Aberdeen Marine 586 Laboratory, Aberdeen
- 587 Granada, L., Sousa, N., Lopes, S., Lemos, M.F.L., 2016. Is integrated multitrophic aquaculture 588 the solution to the sectors' major challenges? - a review. Rev Aquac 8:283–300, 589 doi.org/10.1111/raq.12093
- 590 Grosso, L., Rakaj, A., Fianchini, A., Morroni, L., Cataudella, S., Scardi, M., 2021. Integrated 591 Multi-Trophic Aquaculture (IMTA) system combining the sea urchin *Paracentrotus lividus*, as 592 primary species, and the sea cucumber *Holothuria tubulosa* as extractive species, Aquaculture, 593 534, 736268, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2020.736268
- 594 Hair, C., Mills, D.J., McIntyre, R., Southgate, P.C., 2016. Optimising methods for community-595 based sea cucumber ranching: Experimental releases of cultured juvenile Holothuria scabra 596 into seagrass meadows in Papua New Guinea. Aqua Rep 3:198-208, 597 https://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12348/82
- Hamel, J.F., Mercier, A., 1997. Sea Cucumbers: Current Fishery and Prospects for Aquaculture.
 Aquaculture Magazine 23(1):42-53
- 600 Hannah, L., Pearce, C.M., Cross, S.F., 2013. Growth and survival of California sea cucumbers
- 601 (Parastichopus californicus) cultivated with sablefish (Anoplopoma fimbria) at an integrated
- 602multi-trophicaquaculturesite.Aquaculture406–407:34-42,
- 603 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2013.04.022
- Hargrave, B.T., Phillips, G.A., Doucette, L.I., White, M.J., Milligan, T.G., Wildish, D.J., Cranston,
 R.E., 1997. Assessing benthic impacts of organic enrichment from marine aquaculture. Water
 Air Soil Pollut 99:641-650, doi.org/10.1007/978-94-011-5552-6_65
- Hargrave, B.T., Holmer, M., Newcombe, C.P., 2008. Towards a classification of organic
 enrichment in marine sediments based on biogeochemical indicators. Mar Pollut Bull
 56:810e82, <u>doi: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2008.02.006</u>
- 610 Hills, A., Spurway, J., Brown, S., Cromey, C., 2005. Regulation and monitoring of marine cage
- fish farming in Scotland—Annex H—methods for modelling in-feed anti-parasitics and benthic
 effects. Stirling, 1–140. https://www.sepa.org.uk/media/113511/fish-farm-manual-annex-
- 612 effects. Stirling, 1–140. https://www.sepa.org.uk/media/113511/fish-farm-manual-annex-613 h.pdf
- Hochard, S., Ducrocq, M., Lemonnier, H., Royer, F. et al, 2016. Holothurie : Lien entre
 performances de production et de bioremédiation dans le contexte de la crevetticulture en
 Nouvelle-Calédonie. Projet Hobical. Rapport du programme Zonéco.
- 617 Hou, S., Jin, Z., Jiang, W., Chi, L., Xia, B., Chen, J., 2019. Physiological and immunological
- 618 responses of sea cucumber Apostichopus japonicus during desiccation and subsequent
- 619 resubmersion. PeerJ. 2019 Aug 2;7:e7427. doi: 10.7717/peerj.7427. PMID: 31396455; PMCID: 620 PMACC68170C
- 620 PMC6681796.

- 621 Irisarri, J., Fernández-Reiriz, M.J., Labarta, U., Cranford, P.J., Robinson, S.M., 2015. Availability
- and utilization of waste fish feed by mussels *Mytilus edulis* in a commercial integrated multi trophic aquaculture (IMTA) system: a multi-indicator assessment approach. Ecol Indic
 48:673–686, 10.1016/j.ecolind.2014.09.030
- ISO 5667-19 : 2004 Qualité de l'eau échantillonnage Partie 19 : lignes directrices pour
 l'échantillonnage des sédiments en milieu marin.
- Jobson, S., Hamel, J-F., Taylor, H., Mercier, A., 2021. Cellular, Hormonal, and Behavioral
 Responses of the Holothuroid *Cucumaria frondosa* to Environmental Stressors. Front. Mar.
 Sci., 8, 1257. <u>10.3389/fmars.2021.695753</u>
- Jusup, M., Klanjšček, J., Petricioli, D., Legović, T., 2009. Predicting aquaculture-derived benthic
 organic enrichment: Model validation. Ecol Model 220 (19):2407-2414,
 10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2009.06.033
- Kamyab, E., Kühnhold, H., Novais, S.C. et al. 2017. Effects of thermal stress on the immune and
 oxidative stress responses of juvenile sea cucumber *Holothuria scabra*. J Comp Physiol
 D 187, 51, 61, https://doi.org/10.1007/c00260.016.1015
- 635 B 187, 51–61. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00360-016-1015-z
- Keeley, N.B., Cromey, C.J., Goodwin, E.O., Gibbs, M.T., Macleod, C.M., 2013. Predictive
 depositional modelling (DEPOMOD) of the interactive effect of current flow and resuspension
 on ecological impacts beneath salmon farms. Aquacult Environ Interact 3:275-291,
 DOI:10.3354/aei00068
- 640 Kiew, P.L., Don, M.M., 2012. Jewel of the seabed: sea cucumbers as nutritional and drug 641 candidates. Int J Food Sci Nutr 63:5:616-636, <u>doi.org/</u>10.3109/09637486.2011.641944
- Kutti, T., Hansen, P.K., Ervik, A., Hoisaeter, T., Johannessen, P., 2007. Effects of organic
 effluents from a salmon farm on a fjord system. II. Temporal and spatial patterns in infauna
 community composition. Aquaculture 262:355–366, doi: 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2008.06.032
- MacDonald, C.L.E., Stead, S.M., Slater, M.J., 2013. Consumption and remediation of European
 Seabass (*Dicentrarchus labrax*) waste by the sea cucumber *Holothuria forskali*. Aquacult
 Int 21:1279–1290, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10499-013-9629-6</u>
- 648 Magill, S.H., Thetmeyer, H., Cromey, C.J., 2006. Settling velocity of faecal pellets of gilthead 649 sea bream (*Sparus aurata* L.) and sea bass (*Dicentrarchus labrax* L.) and sensitivity analysis 650 using measured data in a deposition model. Aquaculture 251:2–4:295-305
- Mathieu-Resuge, M., Le Grand, F., Schaal, G., Kraffe, E., Lorrain, A., Letourneur, Y., Lemonnier,
 H., Benoît, J., Hochard, S., 2020. Assimilation of shrimp farm sediment by *Holothuria scabra*: a
 coupled fatty acid and stable isotope approach. Aquat Living Resour 33 3,
 https://doi.org/10.1051/alr/2020004
- Mazzola, A, Sarà, G., 2001. The effect of fish farming organic waste on food availability for
 bivalve molluscs (Gaeta Gulf, Central Tyrrhenian, Mediterranean): stable carbon isotopic
 analysis. Aquaculture 192:361–379, DOI:10.1016/S0044-8486(00)00463-4
- 658 Meloni, D., Esposito, G., 2018. Hygienic and commercial issues related to the illegal fishing and 659 processing of sea cucumbers in the Mediterranean: A case study on over-exploitation in Italy 660 between 2015 and 2017. Regional Studies in Marine Science 19:43-46, 661 doi.org/10.1016/j.rsma.2018.03.009

- Menoyo, D., Lopez-Bote, C.J., Diez, A., Obach, A., Bautista, J.M., 2007. Impact of n-3 fatty acid chain length and n-3/n-6 ratio in Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) diets. Aquaculture 267:248–259, <u>10.1016/j.aquaculture.2007.02.031</u>
- 665 Mezali, K., Soualili, D.L., 2013. Capacité de sélection des particules sédimentaires et de la 666 matière organique chez les holothuries La Bêche-de-mer, Bulletin de la CPS N°33, 38-43

Mfilinge, P.L., Tsuchiya, M., 2016. Changes in sediment fatty acid composition during passage
through the gut of deposit feeding Holothurians: *Holothuria atra* (Jaeger, 1883)
and *Holothuria leucospilota* (Brandt, 1835). J Lipids: 1–9,
https://doi.org/10.1155/2016/4579794

- Nelson, E.J., MacDonald, B.A., Robinson, S.M.C., 2012. The absorption efficiency of the
 suspension-feeding sea cucumber, *Cucumaria frondosa*, and its potential as an extractive
 integrated multi-trophic aquaculture (IMTA) species, Aquaculture 370–371:19-25,
 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2012.09.029
- 675 Neofitou, N., Lolas, A., Ballios, I., Skordas, K., Tziantziou, L., Vafidis, D., 2019. Effects of sea
- 676 cucumber Holothuria tubulosa on organic load reduction from fish farming operation in
- 677 laboratory conditions. Aquaculture 501:97-103, DOI:10.1016/j.aquaculture.2018.10.071
- NewDEPOMOD Development Team, 2019. DEPOMOD. Scottish Association for Marine
 Science, Oban. https://depomod.sams.ac.uk/ (accessed 17 Sep 2020)
- Ocana, A., Sanchez Tocino, L., 2005. Spawning of *Holothuria tubulosa* (*Holothurioidea*,
 Echinodermata) in the Alboran Sea (Mediterranean Sea). Zool Baetica 16:147–150
- Pangestuti, R., Arifin, Z., 2018. Medicinal and health benefit effects of functional sea
 cucumbers. Journal of Traditional and Complementary Medicine 8:3:341-351,
 doi.org/10.1016/j.jtcme.2017.06.007
- Park, H.J., Han, E., Lee, W.C., Kwak, J.H., Kim, H.C., Park, M.S., Kang, C.K., 2015. Trophic
 structure in a pilot system for the integrated multi-trophic aquaculture off the east coast of
 Korean peninsula as determined by stable isotopes. Mar Pollut Bull 95(1):207-14,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2015.04.019
- Parnell, A.C., Jackson, A.L., 2013. SIAR: stable isotope analysis in R. R package version 4.2.
 http://CRAN.R-project.org/ package=siar
- 691 Purcell, S.W., Mercier, A., Conand, C., Hamel, J.F., Toral-Granda, M.V., Lovatelli, A., Uthicke,
- 692 S., 2013. Sea cucumber fisheries: global analysis of stocks, management measures and drivers
 693 of overfishing. Fish Fish 14(1):34-59, doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-2979.2011.00443.x
- Purcell, S.W., Conand, C., Uthicke, S., Byrne, M., 2016. Ecological roles of exploited sea
 cucumbers. Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review 54: 367-386,
 DOI:10.1201/9781315368597-8
- Purcell, S.W., Williamson, D.H., Ngaluafe, P., 2018. Chinese market prices of beche-de-mer:
 Implications for fisheries and aquaculture. Marine Policy 91:58-65,
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpol.2018.02.005
- 700 Raimbault, P., Diaz, F., Boudjellal, B., 1999. Simultaneous determination of particulate forms
- of carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus collected on filters using a semi-automatic wet-oxidation
- 702 procedure. Mar Ecol Progr Ser 180:289-295, DOI:10.3354/meps180289

- Raimbault, P., Garcia, N., Cerrutti, F., 2008. Distribution of inorganic and organic nutrients in
 the South Pacific Ocean. Evidence for long-term accumulation of organic matter in nitrogen-
- 705 depleted waters. Biogeosciences 5:281-29, <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-5-281-2008</u>

Rakaj, A., Fianchini, A., Boncagni, P., Lovatelli, A., Scardi, M., Cataudella, S., 2017. Spawning
and rearing of *Holothuria tubulosa*: A new candidate for aquaculture in the Mediterranean
region. Aquac Res 49, DOI:10.1111/are.13487

Rakaj, A., Fianchini, A., Boncagni, P., Scardi, M., Cataudella, S., 2019. Artificial reproduction of *Holothuria polii:* A new candidate for aquaculture. Aquaculture 498:444–453,
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2018.08.060

- Ricart, A., & Dalmau, A., & Pérez, M., & Romero, J., 2015. Effects of landscape configuration
 on the exchange of materials in seagrass ecosystems. MEPS, 532. 89-100. <u>10.3354/meps11384</u>
- 714 Riera, R., Pérez, Ó., Cromey, C., Rodríguez, M., Ramos, E., Álvarez, O., Domínguez, J.,
- 715 Monterroso, Ó., Tuya, F., 2017. MACAROMOD: A tool to model particulate waste dispersion
- 716 and benthic impact from offshore sea-cage aquaculture in the Macaronesian region. Ecol
- 717 Model 361:122–134, <u>10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2017.08.006</u>
- Salvo, F., Dufour, S.C., Hamoutene, D., Parrish, C.C., 2015. Lipid Classes and Fatty Acids in
 Ophryotrocha cyclops, a Dorvilleid from Newfoundland Aquaculture Sites. P ONE
 10(8):e0136772, doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0136772
- Santos, R., Dias, S., Pinteus, S., Silva, J., Alves, C., Tecelão, C., Pedrosa, R., Pombo, A., 2016. Sea
 cucumber *Holothuria forskali*, a new resource for aquaculture? Reproductive biology and
 nutraceutical approach. Aquac Res 47:2307-2323, doi.org/10.1111/are.12683
- 724 Schowalter, D., 2016. Decomposition and Pedogenesis Insect Ecology (Fourth Edition)
- 725 SHOM, 2015. http://dx.doi.org/10.17183/MNT_MED100m_CORSE_HOMONIM_WGS84
- Slater, M.J., Carton, A.G., 2007. Survivorship and growth of the sea cucumber
 Australostichopus (Stichopus) mollis (Hutton 1872) in polyculture trials with green-lipped
 mussel farms. Aquaculture 272:389–398, DOI:10.1016/j.aquaculture.2007.07.230
- Slater, M.J., Carton, A.G., 2010. Sea cucumber habitat differentiation and site retention as
 determined by intraspecific stable isotope variation. Aquac Res 41:e695–e702,
 DOI:10.1111/j.1365-2109.2010.02607.x
- Stutterd, E., Williams, G., 2003. The future of bêche-de-mer and trochus fisheries and
 aquaculture in Australia. Final report to the Fisheries Resources Research Fund
- Sun, J., Hamel, J.F., Gianasi, B.L., Graham, M., Mercier, A., 2020. Growth, health and
 biochemical composition of the sea cucumber *Cucumaria frondosa* after multi-year holding in
 effluent waters of land-based salmon culture. Aquacult Environ Interact 12:139-151,
 DOI:10.3354/aei00356
- Tanzer, J., Phua, C., Jeffries, B., Lawrence, A., Gonzales, A., Gamblin, P., Roxburgh, T., 2015.
 Living blue planet report. Gland, Switz.: WWF International
- Tolon, T, Emiroğlu, D., Günay, D., Saygı, H., 2015. Effect of Sediment Grain Size on Growth
 Performance of Juvenile Sea Cucumber (*Holothuria tubulosa*). Turk J Fish Aquat Sci 15:55–
- 742 559

- Tolon, T, Emiroğlu, D., Günay, D., Ozgul, A., 2017a. Sea cucumber *Holothuria tubulosa* (Gmelin,
- 1790) culture under marine fish net cages for potential use in integrated multi-trophic
- aquaculture (IMTA). Indian Journal of Geo Marine Sciences 46 (04):749-756

Tolon, T, Emiroğlu, D., Günay, D., Hancı, B., 2017b. Effect of stocking density on growth
performance of juvenile sea cucumber *Holothuria tubulosa* (Gmelin, 1788). Aquac Res
48:4124–4131, DOI:10.1111/ARE.13232

Troell, M., Joyce, A., Chopin, T., Neori, A., Buschmann, A.H., Fang, J.G., 2009. Ecological engineering in aquaculture — Potential for integrated multi-trophic aquaculture (IMTA) in marine offshore systems. Aquaculture 297: 1–9, <u>doi:10.1016/j.aquaculture.2009.09.010</u>

- Twining, C.W., Brenna, J.T., Hairston, N.G., Flecker, A.S., 2016. Highly unsaturated fatty acids
 in Nature: What we know and what we need to learn. Oikos 125(6):749–760,
 doi:10.5061/dryad.67dg6
- Vizzini, S., Mazzola, A., 2004. Stable isotope evidence for the environmental impact of a landbased fish farm in the western Mediterranean. Mar. Pollut. Bull., 49, 1–2, pp 61-70,
- 757 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marpolbul.2004.01.008
- White, C.A., Nichols, P.D., Ross, D.J., Dempster, T., 2017. Dispersal and assimilation of an
 aquaculture waste subsidy in a low productivity coastal environment. Mar Pollut Bull 120 (12):309-321, <u>doi: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2017.05.042.</u>
- Wolkenhauer, S.M., Uthicke, S., Burridge, C., Skewes, T., Pitcher, C., 2010. The ecological role
 of *Holothuria scabra (Echinodermata: Holothuroidea)* within subtropical seagrass beds. J Mar
 Biol Assoc UK. 90:215-223, <u>doi.org/10.1017/S0025315409990518</u>
- Xue, Z., Li, H., Wang, X., Li, X., Liu, Y., Sun, J., Liu, C., 2015. A review of the immune molecules
 in the sea cucumber. Fish Shellfish Immunol (1):1-11, doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2015.01.026
- 766 Yingst, J.Y., 1982. Factors influencing rates of sediment ingestion by *Parastichopus parvimensis*
- 767 (Clark), an epibenthic deposit-feeding holothurian. Estuar Coast Shelf Sci 14:119–134



Fig. 1. Deposition of particulate waste from the fish farm (expressed in g of solids.m⁻².year⁻¹) simulated by NewDEPOMOD (from 24 September to 24 October 2019) for sites "0", "25", "100" and the reference site. The cages are represented by black circles and squares. Results were transferred to ArcGIS to create the graph. Black squares represent the 32 squared rearing cages of the farm and circles the 2 round rearing cages.



Fig. 2. Total organic nitrogen (TON), phosphorus (TOP) and carbon (TOC), expressed in %, in the final sampled sediment, at different distances from the fish cages (0, 25, 100 m and reference). Letters indicate significant differences between groups (F test, $\alpha = 5\%$).



Fig. 3. Stable isotope values (δ^{13} C, δ^{15} N) of the fish feed and sediments sampled at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference (ref). A: Biplot of δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N (‰) of the fish feed and sediments sampled at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. B: δ^{15} N values (‰) of the fish feed and sediments sampled at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. C: δ^{13} C values (‰) of the fish feed and sediments sampled at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. Letters indicate significant differences between measurements performed on the sediment samples.



Fig. 4. Mean (±SD) stable isotope values (δ^{13} C, δ^{15} N) of *H. tubulosa* kept for a month at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference (ref), with 'initial' referring to the wild sea cucumber fished at the reference site. A: Biplot of δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N (‰) of the sea cucumbers kept at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. B: δ^{15} N values (‰) of the sea cucumbers kept at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. C: δ^{13} C values of the sea cucumbers kept at four distances from the fish cages: 0, 25, 100 m and reference. Letters indicate significant differences between samples.



Fig. 5. *H. tubulosa* body weight (mean and SD, in g) after 1 month of exposure at four distances from the farm. A: body wet weight at initial (white box plot) and final sampling (grey box plot), B: body dry weight after 1 month of exposure at four distances from the fish cages (0 m, 25 m, 100 m and Reference).



Fig. 6. *H. tubulosa* protein content (in % of dry sample) at four distances from the fish cages (0 m, 25 m, 100 m and reference). Letters indicate significant differences between groups (F test, $\alpha = 5\%$)



Figure 7. (A) PCA on fatty acid profiles of the sea cucumbers at the 4 distances from the fish cages. (B) Coordinates on the second dimension for each site. (C) Fatty acids contributing the most to the variability on the second dimension of the PCA.

Table 1. Major fatty acids analysed in *H. tubulosa* samples (mean ± SD, in µg.mg⁻¹ of dry weight) from the four sites (and baseline wild samples), with the total saturated FAs (SFAs), monounsaturated FAs (MUFAs), polyunsaturated FAs (PUFAs), and dimethyl acetal (DMA).

| SAMPLES | 0 | 25 | 100 | REF | <mark>BASELINE</mark> |
|---------------|-----------|-----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------------------|
| NB OF SAMPLES | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 14:0 | 0.01±0.00 | 0.02±0.01 | 0.02±0.1 | 0.03±0.0 | $0.03\pm\!\!0.01$ |
| 16:0 | 0.05±0.01 | 0.06±0.03 | 0.06±0.02 | 0.08±0.0 | 0.12 ± 0.05 |
| 17:0 | 0.01±0.00 | 0.01 ± 0.00 | 0.01±0.0 | 0.2±0.0 | 0.01±0.00 |
| ISO 17:0 | 0.01±0.00 | 0.01±0.01 | 0.01±0.0 | 0.01±0.0 | 0.01±0.00 |
| 18:0 | 0.10±0.03 | 0.11±0.02 | 0.12±0.02 | 0.13±0.01 | 0.12±0.01 |
| 20:1N-11 | 0.05±0.02 | 0.04±0.03 | 0.05±0.03 | 0.06±0.04 | 0.03±0.02 |
| 20:4N-6 | 0.09±0.04 | 0.07±0.07 | 0.09±0.05 | 0.11±0.08 | 0.05±0.03 |
| 18:0DMA | 0.13±0.04 | 0.13±0.03 | 0.16±0.03 | 0.14±0.02 | 0.12±0.03 |
| TOT. SFAs | 0.35±0.10 | 0.39±0.06 | 0.42±0.08 | 0.46±0.03 | 0.46±0.07 |
| TOT. MUFAs | 0.15±0.05 | 0.13±0.08 | 0.16±0.09 | 0.17±0.12 | 0.14±0.06 |
| TOT. PUFAs | 0.16±0.07 | 0.13±0.10 | 0.16±0.09 | 0.19±0.13 | 0.11±0.05 |
| TOT. DMAs | 0.14±0.04 | 0.14±0.03 | 0.17±0.03 | 0.15±0.02 | 0.13±0.03 |
| TOTAL FAs | 0.84±0.26 | 0.83±0.20 | 0.94±0.30 | 1.02±0.30 | 0.91±0.17 |

Table 2. Bacterial fatty acids, diatom and zooplankton markers analysed in *H. tubulosa* samples (mean \pm SD, in % of Total Fatty Acids) at initial sampling for wild animals and final sampling for the experimental sites (0, 25, 100 and reference according to distances to the cages in m).

| SAMPLES | 0 | 25 | 100 | REF | INITIAL |
|--|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| BACTERIAL FAS: 15:0, 16:0, 17:0, 16:1N-7, 17:1N-X, 18:1N-7 | 13.4±1.1 | 17.9±9.3 | 15.2±1.7 | 18.5±1.8 | 28.2±8.8 |
| DIATOM MARKER 20:5N-3 | 2.8±0.6 | 2.3±1.8 | 2.7±1.2 | 2.7±2.4 | 2.0±0.9 |
| ZOOPLANKTON MARKERS: 20:1N- 9, 22:1N-9 | 1.1±0.2 | 1.1±0.9 | 1.3±0.6 | 1.1±0.9 | 0.6±0.3 |