

Morphological and phylogenetic data do not support the split of Alexandrium into four genera

Kenneth Neil Mertens, Masao Adachi, Donald M. Anderson, Christine J. Band-Schmidt, Isabel Bravo, Michael L. Brosnahan, Christopher J. S. Bolch, António J. Calado, M. Consuelo Carbonell-Moore, Nicolas Chomérat, et al.

▶ To cite this version:

Kenneth Neil Mertens, Masao Adachi, Donald M. Anderson, Christine J. Band-Schmidt, Isabel Bravo, et al.. Morphological and phylogenetic data do not support the split of Alexandrium into four genera. Harmful Algae, 2020, 98, pp.101902. 10.1016/j.hal.2020.101902 . hal-03411046

HAL Id: hal-03411046 https://hal.umontpellier.fr/hal-03411046

Submitted on 21 Sep 2022

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Version of Record: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1568988320301815 Manuscript_63f185668e5d70c91c4d8ef0f1eeda6c

1	Morphological and phylogenetic data do not support the split of Alexandrium into four genera
2	
3	Kenneth Neil Mertens ^{1*} , Masao Adachi ² , Donald M. Anderson ³ , Christine Band-Schmidt ⁴ , Isabel
4	Bravo ⁵ , Michael L. Brosnahan ² , Christopher J.S. Bolch ⁶ , António J. Calado ⁷ , M. Consuelo Carbonell-
5	Moore ⁸ , Nicolas Chomérat ¹ , Malte Elbrächter ⁹ , Rosa Isabel Figueroa ⁵ , Santiago Fraga ¹⁰ , Ismael
6	Gárate-Lizárraga ¹¹ , Esther Garcés ¹² , Haifeng Gu ¹³ , Gustaaf Hallegraeff ¹⁴ , Philipp Hess ¹⁵ , Mona
7	Hoppenrath ¹⁶ , Takeo Horiguchi ¹⁷ , Mitsunori Iwataki ¹⁸ , Uwe John ¹⁹ , Anke Kremp ²⁰ , Jacob Larsen ²¹ ,
8	Chui Pin Leaw ²² , Zhun Li ²³ , Po Teen Lim ²² , Wayne Litaker ²⁴ , Lincoln MacKenzie ²⁵ , Estelle
9	Masseret ²⁶ , Kazumi Matsuoka ²⁷ , Øjvind Moestrup ²¹ , Marina Montresor ²⁸ , Satoshi Nagai ²⁹ , Elisabeth
10	Nézan ^{1,30} , Tomohiro Nishimura ²⁵ , Yuri B. Okolodkov ³¹ , Tatiana Yu. Orlova ³² , Albert Reñé ¹² , Nagore
11	Sampedro ¹² , Cecilia Teodora Satta ³³ , Hyeon Ho Shin ³⁴ , Raffaele Siano ³⁵ , Kirsty F. Smith ²⁵ , Karen
12	Steidinger ³⁶ , Yoshihito Takano ³⁷ , Urban Tillmann ¹⁹ , Jennifer Wolny ³⁸ , Aika Yamaguchi ¹⁷ , Shauna
13	Murray ³⁹
14	
15	¹ Ifremer, LER BO, Station de Biologie Marine, Place de la Croix, BP40537, F-29185 Concarneau
16	Cedex, France
17	² Laboratory of Aquatic Environmental Science (LAQUES), Faculty of Agriculture and Marine
18	Science, Kochi University, 200 Otsu, Monobe, Nankoku, Kochi 783-8502, Japan
19	³ Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution. Woods Hole, MA 02543, USA
20	⁴ Departamento de Plancton y Ecología Marina, Instituto Politécnico Nacional, Centro
21	Interdisciplinario de Ciencias Marinas (IPN-CICIMAR), La Paz, B.C.S. 23096, Mexico
22	⁵ Instituto Español de Oceanografía (IEO) and GeoBioTec Research Unit, C.O. Vigo, 36280 Vigo,
23	Spain
24	⁶ Institute for Marine & Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania, Locked Bag 1370, Launceston TAS
25	7250, Australia
26	⁷ Department of Biology, University of Aveiro, P-3810-193 Aveiro, Portugal
27	⁸ Department of Botany and Plant Pathology, College of Agricultural Sciences, Oregon State
28	University, Corvallis, Oregon 97331-2902, USA

- 29 ⁹Alfred-Wegener-Institut, Helmholtz-Zentrum für Polar- und Meeresforschung Sylt, Hafenstr. 43,
- 30 25992 List/Sylt, Germany
- 31 ¹⁰Praza Mestra Manuela 1, 36340 Nigrán, Spain
- 32 ¹¹Instituto Politécnico Nacional, Centro Interdisciplinario de Ciencias Marinas, Apartado Postal 592,
- 33 Col. Centro, La Paz, B.C.S. 23000, Mexico
- ¹²Departament de Biologia Marina i Oceanografía, Institut de Ciències del Mar, Consejo Superior de
- 35 Investigaciones Científicas (CSIC), Pg. Marítim de la Barceloneta 37-49, 08003 Barcelona, Spain
- ¹³Third Institute of Oceanography, Ministry of Natural Resources, Xiamen 361005, China
- 37 ¹⁴Institute of Marine and Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania, Private Bag 129, Hobart,
- 38 Tasmania 7001, Australia
- 39 ¹⁵Ifremer, DYNECO, Laboratoire Phycotoxines, Rue de l'Ile d'Yeu, 44311 Nantes, France
- 40 ¹⁶Senckenberg am Meer, German Center for Marine Biodiversity Research, Wilhelmshaven, Germany
- 41 ¹⁷Department of Biological Sciences, Faculty of Science, Hokkaido University, North 10, West 8,
- 42 Sapporo 060-0810, Hokkaido, Japan
- 43 ¹⁸Asian Natural Environmental Science Center, The University of Tokyo, Bunkyo, Tokyo 113-8657,
- 44 Japan
- 45 ¹⁹Alfred-Wegener-Institut, Helmholtz-Zentrum für Polar- und Meeresforschung, Bremerhaven,
- 46 *Germany*
- 47 ²⁰Leibniz Institut für Ostseeforschung Warnemünde, Seestr. 15, 18119 Rostock, Germany
- 48 ²¹Marine Biological Section, Department of Biology, University of Copenhagen, Universitetsparken 4,
- 49 DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø, Denmark
- 50 ²²Bachok Marine Research Station, Institute of Ocean and Earth Sciences, University of Malaya,
- 51 16310 Bachok, Kelantan, Malaysia
- 52 ²³Biological Resource Center/Korean Collection for Type Cultures (KCTC), Korea Research Institute
- 53 of Bioscience and Biotechnology, Jeongeup 56212, Republic of Korea
- 54 ²⁴CSS Inc. Under contract to NOS/NOAA, Center for Coastal Fisheries and Habitat Research, 101
- 55 Pivers Island Road, Beaufort, North Carolina 28516, USA

- 56 ²⁵Coastal & Freshwater Group, Cawthron Institute, Private Bag 2, 98 Halifax Street East, Nelson
- 57 7042, New Zealand
- 58 ²⁶MARBEC, Université de Montpellier, CNRS, Ifremer, IRD, Montpellier, France
- ²⁷C/O Institute for East China Sea Research, Nagasaki University, 1551-7 Taira-machi, Nagasaki,
- 60 *851-2213, Japan*
- 61 ²⁸Stazione Zoologica Anton Dohrn, Villa Comunale, 80121 Naples, Italy
- 62 ²⁹National Research Institute of Fisheries Science, 2-12-4 Fukuura, Kanazawa-ku, Yokohama,
- 63 Kanagawa, 236-8648, Japan
- ³⁰*National Museum of Natural History, DGD-REVE, Station de Biologie Marine de Concarneau,*
- 65 Place de la Croix, 29900 Concarneau, France
- 66 ³¹Universidad Veracruzana, Instituto de Ciencias Marinas y Pesquerías, Laboratorio de Botánica
- 67 Marina y Planctología, Calle Mar Mediterráneo No. 314, Fracc. Costa Verde, C.P. 94294, Boca del
- 68 Río, Veracruz, México
- 69 ³²A.V. Zhirmunsky National Scientific Center of Marine Biology of the Far Eastern Branch of the
- 70 Russian Academy of Sciences, Palchevskogo Street, 17, Vladivostok 690041, Russia
- ³³Dipartimento di Architettura, Design e Urbanistica, University of Sassari, Via Piandanna 4, 07100
- 72 Sassari, Italy
- ³⁴Library of Marine Samples, Korea Institute of Ocean Science and Technology, Geoje, Republic of
- 74 Korea
- 75 ³⁵Ifremer, DYNECO, PELAGOS, F-29280 Plouzané, France
- ³⁶*Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission Fish and Wildlife Research Institute*
- 77 100 8th Avenue SE St. Petersburg, FL 33701, USA
- 78 ³⁷Faculty of Science and Technology, Kochi University, Japan
- ³⁸Maryland Department of Natural Resources, 1919 Lincoln Drive Annapolis, Maryland 21401 USA
- 80 ³⁹Climate Change Cluster, University of Technology Sydney, Ultimo, NSW, 2007, Australia
- 81
- 82 *Corresponding author: Kenneth Neil Mertens
- 83 E-mail: Kenneth.mertens@ifremer.fr

86 Abstract

A recently published study analyzed the phylogenetic relationship between the genera 87 Centrodinium and Alexandrium, confirming an earlier publication showing the genus Alexandrium as 88 89 paraphyletic. This most recent manuscript retained the genus *Alexandrium*, introduced a new genus 90 Episemicolon, resurrected two genera, Gessnerium and Protogonyaulax, and stated that: "The 91 polyphyly [sic] of Alexandrium is solved with the split into four genera". However, these reintroduced 92 taxa were not based on monophyletic groups. Therefore this work, if accepted, would result in 93 replacing a single paraphyletic taxon with several non-monophyletic ones. The morphological data 94 presented for genus characterization also do not convincingly support taxa delimitations. The 95 combination of weak molecular phylogenetics and the lack of diagnostic traits (i.e., autapomorphies) render the applicability of the concept of limited use. The proposal to split the genus Alexandrium on 96 97 the basis of our current knowledge is rejected herein. The aim here is not to present an alternative 98 analysis and revision, but to maintain Alexandrium. A better constructed and more phylogenetically 99 accurate revision can and should wait until more complete evidence becomes available and there is a 100 strong reason to revise the genus Alexandrium. The reasons are explained in detail by a review of the 101 available molecular and morphological data for species of the genera Alexandrium and Centrodinium. 102 In addition, cyst morphology and chemotaxonomy are discussed, and the need for integrative 103 taxonomy is highlighted.

104

105 **Keywords**: taxonomy, phylogenetics, paraphyletic, saxitoxin, spirolides, harmful algal blooms

106

107 Highlights

• Morpho-molecular data do not support the split of *Alexandrium* into four genera.

- The genera *Episemicolon, Gessnerium*, and *Protogonyaulax* should not be used.
- A proposal to conserve *Alexandrium* against *Centrodinium* will be submitted.

114 The genus Alexandrium includes many species that have caused extensive economic and human 115 health impacts worldwide (e.g., Anderson et al., 2012). Alexandrium currently encompasses 34 116 accepted species, with A. camurascutulum considered invalid (Guiry in Guiry and Guiry, 2020). Of 117 these species, 14 are known to produce paralytic shellfish toxins (PSTs) (Moestrup et al., 2009), which have caused extensive damage to aquaculture industries. The wide range of toxins produced by 118 119 Alexandrium species, belong to four families – PSTs (saxitoxin (STX) and its derivatives), spiroimines 120 (spirolides and gymnodimines), goniodomins (e.g., Lassus et al., 2016), and lytic compounds (e.g., Tillmann and John, 2002; Blossom et al., 2019). The toxins with the most recognized potential for 121 122 economic impact are the PSTs, which are responsible for outbreaks of paralytic shellfish poisoning (PSP), one of the most widespread harmful algal bloom (HAB)-related shellfish poisoning syndromes. 123 124 PSP outbreaks can cause human illness and death from contaminated shellfish or fish, loss of wild and 125 cultured seafood resources, impairment of tourism and recreational activities, alterations of marine 126 trophic structure, and death of marine mammals, fish, and seabirds (Anderson et al., 2012). Symptoms 127 of PSP in humans range from spreading numbress and tingling sensations, headache and nausea to 128 more extreme fatal cases due to respiratory paralysis (Hallegraeff, 2003). Blooms of species such as 129 Alexandrium catenella, A. minutum, and A. pacificum regularly cause losses of tens of millions of 130 dollars to aquaculture industries in North and South America, Europe, Asia (e.g., Trainer and Yoshido, 131 2014; Sanseverino et al., 2016), and Australia and New Zealand (e.g., Jin et al., 2008; MacKenzie, 132 2014). For example, in late 2012, a single bloom of A. catenella along the east coast of Tasmania (Australia) resulted in ~AUD\$ 23 million loss to the wild harvest and aquaculture industries (Condie 133 134 et al., 2019). Monitoring of Alexandrium cells in the water column and of toxins in shellfish is 135 therefore critical for avoidance of adverse effects on human health (e.g., Nagai et al., 2019; EFSA, 2009) and nationally and internationally standardized methods have been established to guide PSP 136 testing (e.g., FAO Marine Biotoxins, 2004; [U.S.] National Shellfish Sanitation Program, 2017; 137 138 Australian Shellfish Quality Assurance Program, 2019; Turner et al., 2019). The European Union 139 requires all its member states to monitor coastal waters for toxin-producing plankton and toxins in

mussels (Directive 91/492d/EC and Commission Decision 2002/225/EC). In parallel, research on *Alexandrium* species is vigorous: since 1975, there have been 2,768 published studies that include the
word *Alexandrium*, which have been cited 70,322 times, for an average of about 150 publications per
year over the last 10 years (Clarivate Analytics search on Web of Science Core Collection on 20
August 2020).

145 The taxonomic history of the genus *Alexandrium* is complex, and nomenclatural stability was not 146 attained for some time, as detailed by Balech (1995, pp. 1–3) and Taylor and Fukuyo (1998). The 147 genus *Alexandrium* was erected by Halim (1960) with the PST-producing *Alexandrium minutum* as its 148 type. A few years later, Halim (1967) erected *Gessnerium* with *Gessnerium mochimaense* Halim as its

- 149 type; this species had a pentagonal first apical (1') plate not in contact with the pore plate (Po).
- 150 Loeblich III and Loeblich (1979) considered *Alexandrium minutum* to be inadequately described, left

151 it in the genus Alexandrium and transferred seven Gonyaulax species and two Goniodoma species into

the genus Gessnerium. At the same time, Taylor (1979) erected Protogonyaulax, with P. tamarensis as

- the type species and defined it as having a 1' plate directly contacting the Po of the apical pore
- 154 complex, and transferred eight species of the genus *Gonyaulax* and one *Pyrodinium* species into

155 *Protogonyaulax*. Taylor's proposal was followed by Fukuyo et al. (1985), who described two new

156 Protogonyaulax species (P. affinis and P. compressa). After a detailed examination of samples from

157 the type locality of *A. minutum* (the type species of *Alexandrium*), Balech (1989) noted that plate 1'

does not necessarily directly contact the Po in this species (the same applies to *A. fraterculus* and *A.*

159 *kutnerae*). He therefore re-established the genus *Alexandrium*, considering *Protogonyaulax* a junior

160 synonym of Alexandrium. All Protogonyaulax and Gessnerium species were thus transferred to

161 Alexandrium (Balech 1985, 1995) and Gessnerium was retained as a subgenus of Alexandrium for

- species in which plate 1' is not rhomboidal and does not contact the Po (Balech, 1995). Since Balech
- 163 (1989), the consensus has been to only use the genus name *Alexandrium*. The currently accepted plate

164 formula for *Alexandrium* is Po, 4', 6'', 6c, 9–10s, 5''', 2'''' (Balech, 1980, 1995; Balech and Tangen,

165 1985).

166 The advent of molecular approaches provided significant contributions to the circumscription 167 of species within this important genus. Morpho-molecular studies suggested that species placed in the 168 subgenus Gessnerium do not form a monophyletic group (John et al., 2003; MacKenzie et al., 2004; 169 Kim et al., 2005; Rogers et al., 2006; Penna et al., 2008; Gu et al., 2013). More recently, a detailed 170 study encompassing the morphology of vegetative cells, phylogenies based on multiple molecular 171 markers, mating compatibility and presence/absence of genes coding for STX and analogues has 172 shown that morphological characters used to identify species within the Alexandrium tamarense 173 complex (A. tamarense and related species) were not consistent, but that molecular markers were able to delineate unambiguous species boundaries (John et al., 2014; but see Fraga et al., 2015 and Litaker 174 et al., 2018). 175

176 Recently, Li et al. (2019) showed that the fusiform dinoflagellate Centrodinium punctatum forms a clade nesting within Alexandrium. Through a morpho-molecular study of two other 177 Centrodinium species (C. eminens and C. intermedium), but without a re-investigation of the type, C. 178 elongatum, Gómez and Artigas (2019) proposed to retain Centrodinium and subdivide the species 179 formerly included in the genus Alexandrium, sharing a common thecal plate pattern, into four distinct 180 genera, namely Alexandrium sensu stricto (s.s.) (emended diagnosis), the re-introduced genera 181 Gessnerium and Protogonyaulax, and the new genus Episemicolon. Here, the data presented in Gómez 182 and Artigas (2019) are critically discussed, and it is shown that they do not support such a drastic 183 184 taxonomic rearrangement. The aim of this study is not to present an alternative analysis and revision, 185 but to maintain the genus Alexandrium. Furthermore, it is emphasized to use integrative taxonomy which delimits taxa using multiple and complementary perspectives (Dayrat, 2005), including the 186 187 consideration of cyst morphology in recognizing taxa (as previously suggested by Taylor and Fukuyo, 188 1998, p. 6) and chemotaxonomy, amongst other criteria.

189

190 The presented phylogenetic trees do not support the proposed subdivision of Alexandrium.

The finding that species of Centrodinium nest phylogenetically in Alexandrium (Li et al., 191 2019; Gómez and Artigas, 2019) makes the latter paraphyletic. Gómez and Artigas (2019) proposed to 192 193 taxonomically split Alexandrium into four separate genera (not including Centrodinium, which never 194 belonged to Alexandrium). This proposal establishes a new genus Episemicolon, while the diagnosis of 195 three other genera (Alexandrium, Gessnerium, and Protogonyaulax) was emended to group subsets of former Alexandrium species. The authors stated that "The polyphyly [sic] of Alexandrium is solved 196 197 with the split into four genera". Notably, Alexandrium was not polyphyletic, but paraphyletic. The 198 suggestion that their proposal 'solved' this problem is the basis for our critique, and thus it is therefore 199 worth evaluating the phylogenetic information presented by Gómez and Artigas (2019) in detail. Our 200 question was: Does the data justify splitting a phylogenetically well-defined group (e.g., John et al., 201 2003; Rogers et al., 2006; Orr et al., 2011; Anderson et al., 2012; Baggesen et al., 2012; Gu et al., 202 2013; Murray et al 2015; Menezes et al., 2018; Kretzschmar et al., 2019), sharing the same Kofoidian 203 plate tabulation, into segregate genera? 204 Gómez and Artigas (2019) presented two phylogenetic trees, Fig. 4 a phylogenetic analysis of 205 alignments of the SSU (18S) region of the rRNA operon and Fig. 5 the D1-D2 region of the LSU 206 (28S) region of the rRNA operon. Each alignment was analyzed using a maximum likelihood (ML)

approach and clades were given with bootstrap support. There was no information on the number of
base pairs analyzed, the number of informative sites, and the alignments were not made available for
evaluation. These phylogenetic analyses are problematic for several reasons:

210

1. In their Fig. 5, the phylogeny using the D1–D2 regions of rRNA, which are generally ~600 bp in
length, the proposed *Alexandrium s.s.* and *Protogonyaulax* are polyphyletic. In their Fig. 4, the
phylogeny using (presumably) partial SSU regions of rRNA, of an unknown length, *Protogonyaulax, Episemicolon* and *Alexandrium s.s.* are all para- or polyphyletic. In other words, based on their own
analysis, the authors propose the replacement of a single paraphyletic taxon (*Alexandrium*) with
several non-monophyletic ones. The generic concepts are not substantiated by the molecular data.
Thus, rather than solving the taxonomic problems, they exacerbate them.

2. There is very little genetic difference between species of *Centrodinium* and *Episemicolon*. In a
comparison of sequences of *C. punctatum* in the NCBI database, a difference of < 1% and < 5% was
found between it and *A. affine* in aligned sequences of SSU and LSU rRNA, which was less than the
genetic differences among species of *Centrodinium*. Species that are highly similar in molecular
genetic sequences of rRNA genes, with identical tabulation when considering plate homologies, need
exceptionally different other autapomorphies in order to be placed in separate genera, and little
evidence of this is found (see below).

226

227 3. The Gómez and Artigas (2019) phylogenies have used short alignments with too few characters and 228 taxon information to accurately infer deeper, clade level branchings within the genus Alexandrium 229 which will be stable into the future. Of the major factors that impact the accuracy of phylogenetic 230 inference, two are particularly important: the length of aligned sequence/number of genes used, and 231 the taxon sampling. Past studies of *Alexandrium* phylogenetics were reviewed (Table 1, John et al., 2003; Leaw et al., 2005; Rogers et al., 2006; Orr et al., 2011; Anderson et al., 2012; Baggesen et al., 232 233 2012; Gu et al 2013; Murray et al., 2014; Murray et al., 2015; Menezes et al., 2018; Gottschling et al., 234 2020), and this showed that clades within *Alexandrium* differed depending on gene and taxon 235 sampling (exemplified by basal clades shown in Table 1). All else being equal, more sequence data 236 and greater taxon sampling generally leads to more accurate and well-supported phylogenies. Murray 237 et al. (2015) conducted an analysis of Alexandrium using a concatenated alignment of eight genes, 238 with a total length of 7308 bp. The position of several of the major clades of *Alexandrium* differed in 239 that analysis, compared to the analysis presented by Gómez and Artigas (2019). Similarly, new 240 ribotypes are still being reported, such as *Alexandrium fragae* (Branco et al., 2020) and three new 241 phylotypes nested within the genus (Nishimura et al., in review). It is likely that these new discoveries 242 and longer alignments/greater gene sampling will lead to more strongly supported phylogenies than 243 those of Gómez and Artigas (2019), whose phylogenies appear to be too weak to support taxonomic 244 rearrangements.

As any taxonomic rearrangement of *Alexandrium* will potentially impact hundreds or thousands of scientists, government regulators, and the seafood industry, it is crucial that the

phylogenetic basis for such a change be exceptionally clear, highly stable, and reproducible by other 247 scientists. However, this has not occurred in this case. Gómez and Artigas (2019) have not provided 248 249 access to their alignment or details of their analytical output. Dinoflagellate lineages display major 250 differences in evolutionary rates in ribosomal RNA genes, particularly in the gonyaulacoid lineage. Examples of this can be seen in Orr et al. (2012), Gu et al. (2013) and Gottschling et al. (2020), in 251 which the species of the Gonyaulacales are generally present on much longer branches than most other 252 253 clades of dinoflagellates, a difference not seen in analyses using nuclear genes (e.g., Kretzschmar et 254 al., 2019). While Gómez and Artigas (2019) selected a potentially suitable model for their ML 255 analyses, inclusion of divergent taxa can still lead to misplacement of taxa/clusters, with high support 256 values, due to various long-branch effects (Kück et al., 2012). No phylogeny-testing (such as leave-257 one-out testing and jackknifing by species/clusters) apart from the bootstrap support was used to 258 determine whether the branch order of taxa/clusters was stable or unaffected by long-branch artifacts. 259 The morphological concepts of the reinstated and emended genera proposed by Gómez and Artigas 260 261 (2019) have little taxonomic value As mentioned in the introduction, *Protogonyaulax* was described by Taylor (1979) as having a 262 263 plate 1' in contact with the Po. As remarked by Balech (1989, p. 210) for the type species of Alexandrium, A. minutum, as well as for A. fraterculus and A. kutnerae, this feature is variable, and the 264 plate 1' can have an indirect contact with the Po through a filiform prolongation of plate 1' 265 266 (Alexandrium acatenella, A. andersonii, A. ostenfeldii, A. tropicale are additional examples; Balech, 1995). Gómez and Artigas (2019) considered species exhibiting only a direct contact of plate 1' to the 267 268 Po as belonging to their emended concept of *Protogonyaulax*, and species with direct or indirect 269 contact (presumably meaning displaying both types) as belonging to their emended genus 270 Alexandrium. However, when reviewing the literature, it is clear that there is no consistency with the 271 application of both genus concepts (Table 2); furthermore, the high variability of the contact between plate 1' and Po within Alexandrium species speaks against considering this as a reliable taxonomic 272

274 Alexandrium s.s., however, this is not so in A. insuetum, A. ostenfeldii, and A. tamutum, species which 275 are retained in *Alexandrium s.s.* in their proposed phylogeny. Finally, the posterior sulcal plate (Sp) of 276 the emended genus *Protogonyaulax* is longer than wide, and in *Alexandrium s.s.* wider than long, but 277 the Sp of A. leei, included in Protogonyaulax, is wider than long and in A. margalefii, included in 278 Alexandrium s.s., longer than wide with an extremely oblique anterior margin (Balech, 1995). In 279 summary, the considerations of Balech (1995) which support synonymization of Protogonyaulax with 280 Alexandrium, still stand. 281 The reinstated genus Gessnerium also presents problems. Gómez and Artigas (2019) included 282 within this genus species with a pentagonal plate 1' not in contact with the Po. They excluded three 283 species with a plate 1' not in contact with the Po from their concept of Gessnerium: A. insuetum, which 284 they included in *Alexandrium s.s.* despite the fact that this species has a pentagonal 1' plate that does 285 not touch the Po (Balech, 1995, Plate XVII, Figs. 1-23), and A. pohangense and A. margalefii, which 286 were not formally attributed to any genus, although were assigned to the Alexandrium s.s. clade in their Fig. 4. The authors considered the quadrangular plate 1' of A. pohangense and A. margalefii as a 287 288 unique character distinguishing them from the other Gessnerium. However, the plate 1' in A. 289 pohangense has a short suture with plate 2' and can therefore be considered pentagonal (Lim et al., 290 2015, their Fig. 4B), and such a short suture can also be observed in A. balechii and A. foedum 291 according to Balech (1995, p. 103), which were classified as Gessnerium by Gómez and Artigas 292 (2019). Within A. taylorii, the plate 1' is known to vary between a quadrangular and pentagonal shape 293 (Delgado et al., 1997). The infraspecific variability of the shape of this plate indicates that it cannot be 294 used as a diagnostic character at the genus level (Table 2). Finally, the Sp of the emended genus 295 Gessnerium is longer than wide and extending obliquely, but in A. monilatum, which is included in 296 this genus, the Sp is rhomboid (Balech, 1995).

character. In addition, Gómez and Artigas (2019) describe the 6" plate as being "usually narrow" in

The main diagnostic character of the new genus Episemicolon is the presence of an anterior 297 attachment pore placed on the dorsal side of the apical pore plate. However, in A. gaarderae the 298 299 anterior attachment pore is defined as semi-dorsal (Larsen and Nguyen-Ngoc, 2004) and in A. 300 monilatum, included in Gessnerium, the anterior attachment pore is slightly to the right of the dorsal 301 side (Balech, 1995). Moreover, A. concavum, which also has a semi-dorsal attachment pore (Larsen 302 and Nguyen-Ngoc, 2004) was placed in Gessnerium by Gómez and Artigas (2019). There is presently 303 insufficient evidence to accept the location of the anterior attachment pore in the apical pore plate as a 304 diagnostic character to separate these taxa at the generic level from other Alexandrium species. In 305 addition, Gómez and Artigas (2019) claim that the shape of the apical pore of *Episemicolon* is unique 306 because it is "oval or bullet" (their Table 1, as "Shape of apical pore plate") which is incorrect because 307 it is comma-shaped (Larsen and Nguyen-Ngoc, 2004), just like other Alexandrium species. 308 The tabulation of the genus Centrodinium, as displayed in Centrodinium punctatum, is 309 identical to that of Alexandrium when taking into account plate homologies (Li et al., 2019). It can not be excluded that some of the differences listed by Gómez and Artigas (2019) such as the shape of the 310 311 apical pore, the presence of a pore in the anterior sulcal plate, etc., could be sufficient to separate this 312 taxon on a subgeneric level. More detailed morphological information on the type species of Centrodinium, C. elongatum, is however required. The large variation in tabulation reported in species 313 314 of Centrodinium by Hernández-Becerril et al. (2010, see their Table 1 for a summary) indicates that 315 further investigation into this genus is needed to properly report on its phylogenetic placement. 316 In summary, the morphological concepts used to separate the reinstated genera from 317 Alexandrium s.s. are highly variable and insufficient to justify a split of the genus Alexandrium. There 318 is also insufficient morphological evidence to decide whether Episemicolon and Centrodinium warrant 319 separate generic names. 320

321 The cyst morphology does not support the new genera

322 Cysts of *Alexandrium* are morphologically diverse (Table 2) and different from cysts of
323 closely related genera, such as *Pyrodinium*, which has process-bearing cysts (e.g., Wall and Dale,
324 1968, pp. 102–103) or *Fragilidium*, which has a very thick layer of mucus (12–18 µm; Owen and

Norris, 1985). Cyst morphology can serve to subdivide genera, as has been proposed for the genus *Protoperidinium* (Harland, 1982). Because cysts are well-known within the genus *Alexandrium* (e.g.,
Bolch et al., 1991; Matsuoka and Fukuyo, 2000; Bravo et al., 2006), they should be taken into account
for the best possible integrative taxonomy. Since there is no consistent cyst morphology that can be
associated with any of the genera proposed by Gómez and Artigas (2019), cyst morphology also does
not unambiguously support the subdivision of *Alexandrium* into these genera.

331

332 There is no evident relationship of the proposed genera to toxin production (chemotaxonomy).

333 Toxin production has long been considered to be a character independent of chemical taxonomy

because the same toxins have been described in very distantly related dinoflagellate genera, e.g.,

335 okadaic acid in *Prorocentrum* spp. and *Dinophysis* spp., STX or analogs in *Alexandrium* spp.,

336 Gymnodinium catenatum, Pyrodinium bahamense as well as in several cyanobacterial species (e.g.,

337 Aphanizomenon flosaquae and Lyngbya wollei), or domoic acid which is produced in several diatom

338 genera of *Pseudo-nitzschia* and *Nitzschia*, as well as in the macroalga *Chondria armata*.

339 For the genera in question here, three toxin groups are worth considering for chemotaxonomy:

340 saxitoxins (STXs), spiroimines (spirolides and gymnodimines) and goniodomins. Based on John et al.

341 (2014), Murray et al. (2015), Lassus et al. (2016), Lugliè et al. (2017), and Branco et al. (2020), STX

342 or analogs are produced by 14 Alexandrium species (A. acatenella, A. affine, A. andersonii, A.

343 australiense, A. catenella, A. cohorticula, A. fragae, A. leei, A. minutum, A. ostenfeldii, A. pacificum,

344 *A. tamarense*¹, *A. tamiyavanichii*, *A. taylorii*), which do not form a clear monophyletic cluster (Murray

et al., 2015, Fig. 1). Due to the spread of STX-production across a range of phylogenetically different

346 *Alexandrium* species, STX-production in this genus appears to be very common but it is not clear

347 whether it should be considered a coherent taxonomic feature for this genus. The increasing number of

348 STX analogues should be systematically re-verified in a large number of geographically diverse

349 strains, with the limits of detection (LOD) and quantification (LOQ) provided.

¹ Following the taxonomic concept of *A. tamarense* of John et al. (2014), only one strain of *A. tamarense* is currently considered to produce low amounts of gonyautoxins (Lugliè et al., 2017).

- 350 Spiroimines are solely known to be produced by *Alexandrium ostenfeldii* (= *Alexandrium*351 *peruvianum*; Kremp et al., 2014; Zurhelle et al., 2018).
- Goniodomins have been reported to be produced by *Alexandrium monilatum*, *Alexandrium hiranoi* and *Alexandrium pseudogonyaulax* (Harris et al., 2020).

Overall, it should be noted that many papers only report positive presence of toxins in a strain but not the LOD or LOQ for those analogues that were not discovered. There are few studies systematically reporting comparative presence of analogues in a wide range of species, e.g. Wiese et al. (2010), for STX group toxins. However, spirolides have not been systematically searched in most *Alexandrium* species and goniodomins have been largely overlooked other than in the three species mentioned above.

360

361 *Conclusions*

The data presented by Gómez and Artigas (2019) are insufficiently robust to form the basis on 362 which to subdivide species of the genus Alexandrium into four different genera, and maintain 363 364 Centrodinium. Resolving consistent generic-level clusters within the genus Alexandrium and across 365 the gonyaulacoids more generally, would require additional detailed morphological re-investigations and more extensive multigene phylogenies, with careful attention to rigorous testing of taxon sampling 366 367 effects, branching order stability, long-branch effects, and careful selection of appropriate multiple 368 outgroups for rooting local versus global dinoflagellate phylogenies. A secondary structure analysis of 369 a more expanded dataset could also be beneficial. Inclusion of cyst morphology and chemotaxonomic 370 information should also be strived for. There is an extensive literature on *Alexandrium* species and this 371 is a very active area of research. If the proposal of Gómez and Artigas (2019) is adopted there will be 372 considerable disruption and confusion to this field of study.

Therefore, here it is recommended to continue using the generic name *Alexandrium* for
species of this complex, and to refrain from using *Protogonyaulax, Gessnerium*, and *Episemicolon*.
The proposals by Gómez and Artigas (2019), if adopted, would introduce taxonomical instability into
this group of species. A proposal to conserve *Alexandrium* against *Centrodinium* will be submitted to
the International Nomenclature Committee for Algae (INA) in parallel to this note. The nomenclatural

stability has particular importance as many species of Alexandrium cause harmful algal blooms and 378 produce potent biotoxins. In addition to the biological scientific community the generic name 379 380 Alexandrium is used also by chemists, medical scientists such as toxicologists, veterinarians, seafood safety regulators, fisheries and aquaculture industry personnel, administrators, and environmental and 381 fisheries policy makers as outlined by Litaker et al. (2018). Furthermore, Alexandrium species are an 382 important component of planktonic assemblages and taxonomic changes can create confusion for 383 384 climate change studies and interpretations of long-term data sets. Finally, it is recommended that 385 morphological criteria used to separate taxa are unambiguous and leave no room for doubt in the 386 attribution of taxa (cf. paragraph 1 of the preamble of the ICN, Turland et al., 2018), that authors make 387 their alignments freely available to allow for coherent progress in the field, and that authors strive for integrative taxonomy (Dayrat, 2005). Conservation of taxon names has been promoted across all 388 389 organisms, to avoid taxonomic anarchy (Garnett and Christidis, 2017). As such, taxonomists should 390 aim to conserve original names as much as possible and new taxa and combinations should only be created when robust morpho-molecular data obliges it (cf. paragraph 12 of the preamble of the ICN, 391 392 Turland et al., 2018).

393

394 Acknowledgements

395 Support to DMA from the NOAA ECOHAB program (Grant #NA15NOS4780181) is gratefully

acknowledged. Support to EG, AR, NS from the COPAs project (CTM2017-86121-R) is

397 acknowledged. Marc Gottschling is acknowledged for interesting and civil discussions. Two

anonymous reviewers are acknowledged for their useful comments.

399

400 References

401 Anderson, D.M., Wall, D., 1978. Potential importance of benthic cysts of *Gonyaulax tamarensis* and
402 *G. excavata* in initiating toxic dinoflagellate blooms. J. Phycol. 14, 224–234.

404	Anderson, D.M., Alpermann, T.J., Cembella, A.D., Collos, Y., Masseret, E., Montresor, M., 2012. The
405	globally distributed genus Alexandrium: Multifaceted roles in marine ecosystems and impacts on
406	human health. Harmful Algae 14, 10–35.
407	
408	The Australian Shellfish Quality Assurance Program Operations Manual. 2019. Available at:
409	http://safefish.com.au/reports/manuals-and-guidelines/the-australian-shellfish-quality-assurance-
410	program-manual (last accessed 2 March 2020).
411	
412	Baggesen, C., Moestrup, Ø., Daugbjerg, N., Krock, B., Cembella, A.D., Madsen, S., 2012. Molecular
413	phylogeny and toxin profiles of Alexandrium tamarense (Lebour) Balech (Dinophyceae) from the west
414	coast of Greenland. Harmful Algae 19, 108–116.
415	
416	Balech, E., 1980. On thecal morphology of dinoflagellates with special emphasis on cingular and
417	sulcal plates. An. Inst. Cienc. del Mar y Limnol. Univ. Nal. Autón. México 7(1), 57-68.
418	
419	Balech, E., 1985. The genus Alexandrium or Gonyaulax of the tamarensis group. In: Anderson, D.M.,
420	White, A.W., Baden, D.G. (Eds.), Toxic Dinoflagellates. Elsevier Publishers B.V., Amsterdam, pp.
421	33–38.
422	
423	Balech, E., 1989. Redescription of Alexandrium minutum Halim (Dinophyceae) type species of the
424	genus Alexandrium. Phycologia 28(2), 206–211.
425	
426	Balech, E., (Ed.) 1995. The genus Alexandrium Halim (Dinoflagellata). Sherkin Island Marine Station,
427	Co. Cork, 151 p.
428	
429	Balech, E., Tangen, K., 1985. Morphology and taxonomy of toxic species in the tamarensis group
430	(Dinophyceae) Alexandrium excavatum (Braarud) comb. nov. and Alexandrium ostenfeldii (Paulsen)

431 comb. nov. Sarsia 70, 333–343.

433	Blossom, H.E., Markussen, B., Daugbjerg, N., Krock, B., Norlin, A., Hansen, P.J., 2019. The cost of
434	toxicity in microalgae: direct evidence from the dinoflagellate Alexandrium. Front. Microbiol. 10,
435	1065.
436	
437	Bolch, C.J., Blackburn, S.I., Cannon, J.A., Hallegraeff, G.M., 1991. The resting cyst of the red-tide
438	dinoflagellate Alexandrium minutum (Dinophyceae). Phycologia 30(2), 215-219.
439	
440	Branco, S., Oliveira, M.M.M., Salgueiro, F., Vilar, M.C.P., Azevedo, S.M.F.O., Menezes, M., 2020.
441	Morphology and molecular phylogeny of a new PST-producing dinoflagellate species: Alexandrium
442	fragae sp. nov. (Gonyaulacales, Dinophyceae). Harmful Algae 95, 101793.
443	
444	Bravo, I., Garcés, E., Diogène, J., Fraga, S., Sampedro, N., Figueroa, R.I., 2006. Resting cysts of the
445	toxigenic dinoflagellate genus Alexandrium in recent sediments from the Western Mediterranean
446	coast, including the first description of cysts of A. kutnerae and A. peruvianum. Eur. J. Phycol. 41(3),
447	293–302.
448	
449	Condie, S.A., Oliver, E.C.J., Hallegraeff, G.M., 2019. Environmental drivers of unprecedented
450	Alexandrium catenella dinoflagellate blooms off eastern Tasmania, 2012–2018. Harmful Algae 87,
451	101628.
452	
453	Dayrat, B., 2005. Towards integrative taxonomy. Biol. J. Linnean Soc. 85, 407-415.
454	
455	Delgado, M., Garcés, E., Vila, M., Camp, J., 1997. Morphological variability in three populations of
456	the dinoflagellate Alexandrium taylori. J. Plankton Res. 19(6), 749-757.
457	

- EFSA, 2009. Scientific Opinion of the Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain on a request from the
 European Commission on Marine Biotoxins in Shellfish Saxitoxin Group. The EFSA Journal 1019,
 1–76.
- 461

462 FAO, 2004. *Marine biotoxins*. Food & Agriculture Organization of the United Nations 80.

- 463
- 464 Fraga, S., Sampedro, N., Larsen, J., Moestrup, Ø., Calado, A.J., 2015. Arguments against the proposal
 465 2302 by John & al. to reject the name *Gonyaulax catenella* (*Alexandrium catenella*). Taxon 64(3),
 466 634–635.
- 467
- 468 Fukuyo, Y., 1985. Morphology of *Protogonyaulax tamarensis* (Lebour) Taylor and *Protogonyaulax*
- 469 *catenella* (Whedon and Kofoid) Taylor from Japanese coastal waters. Bull. Mar. Sci. 37(2), 529–537,
- 470 1 pl.
- 471
- 472 Fukuyo, Y., Inoue, H., 1990. *Alexandrium affine* (Inoue et Fukuyo) Balech. In: Fukuyo, Y., Takano,
- 473 H., Chihara, M., Matsuoka, K. (Eds.), Red tide organisms in Japan an illustrated taxonomic guide.
- 474 Uchida Rokakuho Co. Ltd., Tokyo, pp. 84–85.
- 475
- 476 Fukuyo, Y., Pholpunthin, Y., 1990a. *Alexandrium cohorticula* (Balech) Balech. In: Fukuyo, Y.,
- 477 Takano, H., Chihara, M., Matsuoka, K. (Eds.), Red tide organisms in Japan an illustrated taxonomic
- 478 guide. Uchida Rokakuho Co. Ltd., Tokyo, pp. 88–89.
- 479
- 480 Fukuyo, Y., Pholpunthin, Y., 1990b. Alexandrium leei (Balech) Balech. In: Fukuyo, Y., Takano, H.,
- 481 Chihara, M., Matsuoka, K. (Eds.), Red tide organisms in Japan an illustrated taxonomic guide.
- 482 Uchida Rokakuho Co. Ltd., Tokyo, pp. 92–93.
- 483
- 484 Fukuyo, Y., Yoshida, K., Inoue, H., 1985. *Protogonyaulax* in Japanese coastal waters. In: Anderson,
- 485 D.M., White, A.W., Baden, D.G. (Eds.), Toxic dinoflagellates. Elsevier, New York, p. 27–32.

487	Gaarder, K.R., 1954. Dinoflagellates from the Michael Sars North Atlantic Deep-Sea Expedition 1910.
488	In: Report on the scientific results of the "Michael Sars" north Atlantic deep-sea expedition 1910,
489	carried out under the auspices of the Norwegian government and the superintendence of Sir John
490	Murray, K.C.B., and Dr. Johan Hjort, Volume 2, 1–62.
491	
492	Garnett, S.T., Christidis, L., 2017. Taxonomy anarchy hampers conservation. Nature 546, 25–27.
493	
494	Garrett, M.J., Wolny, J.L., Williams, B.J., Dirks, M.D., Brame, J.A., Richardson, R.W., 2011.
495	Methods for sampling and analysis of marine microalgae in ship ballast tanks: a case study from
496	Tampa Bay, Florida, USA. Algae 26, 181–192.
497	
498	Gómez, F., Artigas, L.F., 2019. Redefinition of the dinoflagellate genus Alexandrium based on
499	Centrodinium: Reinstatement of Gessnerium and Protogonyaulax, and Episemicolon gen. nov.
500	Hindawi Journal of Marine Biology, 1284104.
500	
501	
	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W.,
501	
501 502	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W.,
501 502 503	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases
501 502 503 504	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193–
501 502 503 504 505	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193–
501 502 503 504 505 506	Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193– 208.
501 502 503 504 505 506 507	 Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193–208. Gu, H., Zeng, N., Liu, T., Yang, W., Müller, A., Krock, B., 2013. Morphology, toxicity, and
501 502 503 504 505 506 507 508	 Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193–208. Gu, H., Zeng, N., Liu, T., Yang, W., Müller, A., Krock, B., 2013. Morphology, toxicity, and
501 502 503 504 505 506 507 508 509	 Gottschling, M, Chacón, J, Žerdoner Čalasan, A, Neuhaus, S., Kretschmann, J., Stibor, H., John, W., 2020. Phylogenetic placement of environmental sequences using taxonomically reliable databases helps to rigorously assess dinophyte biodiversity in Bavarian lakes (Germany). Freshw. Biol. 65, 193–208. Gu, H., Zeng, N., Liu, T., Yang, W., Müller, A., Krock, B., 2013. Morphology, toxicity, and phylogeny of <i>Alexandrium</i> (Dinophyceae) species along the coast of China. Harmful Algae 27, 68–81.

Halim, Y., 1960. *Alexandrium minutum*, n. gen. n. sp. dinoflagellé provocant des "eaux rouges". Vie et
Milieu 11, 102–105.

515

Halim, Y., 1967. Dinoflagellates of the south-east Caribbean sea. Int. Rev. gesamten Hydrobiol. 52(5),
701–755.

518

- 519 Hallegraeff, G.M., 2003. Harmful algal blooms: a global overview. In: Hallegraeff, G.M., Anderson,
- 520 D.M., Cembella, A.D. (Eds), Manual on Harmful Marine Microalgae, Vol. 11, 2nd ed. IOC-UNESCO,
 521 Paris, pp. 25–49.

522

523 Harland, R., 1982. A review of Recent and Quaternary organic-walled dinoflagellate cysts of the

524 genus *Protoperidinium*. Palaeontology 25(2), 369–397, pl. 38–42.

525

- 526 Harris, C.M., Reece, K.S., Stec, D.F., Scott, G.P., Jones, W.M., Hobbs, P.L.M., Harris, T.M., 2020.
- 527 The toxin goniodomin, produced by *Alexandrium* spp., is identical to goniodomin A. Harmful Algae528 92, 101707.

529

- 530 Hernández-Becerril, D.U., Bravo-Sierra, E., Ceballos-Corona, J.G.A, Esqueda-Lara, K., Escobar-
- 531 Morales, S., Parra-Toriz, D., 2010. Morphology and taxonomy of the marine planktonic dinoflagellate

532 *Centrodinium pulchrum* Bohm (Dinophyta) from the tropical Mexican Pacific, with comments on the

taxonomy and distribution of the genus *Centrodinium*. Phycologia 49(5), 461–470.

534

Jin, D., Thunberg, E., Hoagland, P., 2008. Economic impact of the 2005 red tide event on commercial
shellfish fisheries in New England. Ocean Coast. Manag. 51(5), 420–429.

- John, U., Fensome, R.A., Medlin, L.K., 2003. The application of a molecular clock based on
- 539 molecular sequences and the fossil record to explain biogeographic distributions within the
- 540 Alexandrium tamarense "species complex" (Dinophyceae). Mol. Biol. Evol. 20(7), 1015–1027.

542	John, U., Litaker, R.W., Montresor, M., Murray, S., Brosnahan, M.L., Anderson, D.M., 2014. Formal
543	revision of the Alexandrium tamarense species complex (Dinophyceae) taxonomy: The Introduction
544	of five species with emphasis on molecular-based (rDNA) classification. Protist 165, 779-804.
545	
546	Kim, KY., Yoshida, M., Kim, C.H., 2005. Molecular phylogeny of three hitherto unreported
547	Alexandrium species: Alexandrium hiranoi, Alexandrium leei and Alexandrium satoanum
548	(Gonyaulacales, Dinophyceae) inferred from the 18S and 26S rDNA sequence data. Phycologia 44(4),
549	361–368.
550	
551	Kita, T., Fukuyo, Y., Tokuda, H., Hirano, R., 1993. Sexual reproduction of Alexandrium hiranoi
552	(Dinophyceae). Bull. Plankton Soc. Japan 39, 79–85.
553	
554	Kremp, A., Lindholm, T., Dreßler, N., Erler, K., Gerdts, G., Eirtovaara, S., Leskinen, E., 2009. Bloom
555	forming Alexandrium ostenfeldii (Dinophyceae) in shallow waters of the Åland Archipelago, Northern
556	Baltic Sea. Harmful Algae 8, 318–328.
557	
558	Kremp, A., Tahvanainen, P., Litaker, W., Krock, B., Suikkanen, S., Leaw, C.P., Tomas, C., 2014.
559	Phylogenetic relationships, morphological variation, and toxin patterns in the Alexandrium ostenfeldii
560	(Dinophyceae) complex: implications for species boundaries and identities. J. Phycol. 50, 81-100.
561	
562	Kretzschmar, A.L., Verma, A., Murray, S., Kahlke, T., Fourment, M., Darling, A.E., 2019. Trial by
563	phylogenetics - evaluating the multi-species coalescent for phylogenetic inference on taxa with high
564	levels of paralogy (Gonyaulacales, Dinophyceae). bioRxiv 683383; doi:
565	https://doi.org/10.1101/683383.
566	
567	Kück, P., Mayer, C., Wägele, JW., Misof, B., 2012. Long branch effects distort maximum likelihood
568	phylogenies in simulations despite selection of the correct model. PLoS One 0036593.

570

571

572	
573	Lassus P., Chomérat, N., Hess, P., Nézan, E., 2016. Toxic and Harmful Microalgae of the World
574	Ocean / Micro-algues toxiques et nuisibles de l'océan mondial. Denmark, International Society for the
575	Study of Harmful Algae / Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission of UNESCO. IOC Manuals
576	and Guides, 68 [Bilingual English/French].
577	
578	Leaw, C.P., Lim, P.T., Ng, B.K., Cheah, M.Y., Ahmad, A., Usup, G., 2005. Phylogenetic analysis of
579	Alexandrium species and Pyrodinium bahamense (Dinophyceae) based on theca morphology and
580	nuclear ribosomal gene sequence. Phycologia 44(5), 550-565.
581	
582	Li, Z., Mertens, K.N., Nézan, E., Chomérat, N., Bilien, G., Iwataki, M., Shin, H.H., 2019. Discovery of
583	a new clade nested within the genus Alexandrium (Dinophyceae): Morpho-molecular characterization
584	of Centrodinium punctatum (Cleve) F.J.R. Taylor. Protist 170(2), 168-186.
585	
586	Lim, A.S., Jeong, H.J., Kim, J.H., Lee, S.Y., 2015. Description of the new phototrophic dinoflagellate
587	Alexandrium pohangense sp. nov. from Korean coastal waters. Harmful Algae 46, 49-61.
588	
589	Litaker, R.W., Fraga, S., Montresor, M., Brosnahan, M., Anderson, D.M., Hoppenrath, M., Murray, S.,
590	Wolny, J., John, U., Sampedro, N., Larsen, J., Calado, A.J., 2018. A practical guide to new
591	nomenclature for species within the "Alexandrium tamarense species complex". Harmful Algae News
592	61, 13–15.
593	
594	Loeblich III, A.R., Loeblich, L.A., 1979. The systematics of Gonyaulax with special reference to the
595	toxic species. In: Taylor, D.L., Seliger, H.H. (Eds.), Toxic dinoflagellate blooms. Elsevier North.
596	Holl., New York, pp. 41–46.

Larsen, J., Nguyen-Ngoc, L. (Eds.), 2004. Potentially toxic microalgae of Vietnamese waters. Opera

Bot. 140, 5–216 [in English and Vietnamese].

598	Lugliè, A., Giacobbe, M.G., Riccardi, E., Bruno, M., Pigozzi, S., Mariani, M.A., Satta, C.T., Stacca,
599	D., Bazzoni, A.M., Caddeo, T., Farina, P., Padedda, B.M., Pulina, S., Sechi, N., Milandri, A., 2017.
600	Paralytic Shellfish Toxins and Cyanotoxins in the Mediterranean: New Data from Sardinia and Sicily
601	(Italy). Microorganisms 5, 72.
602	
603	MacKenzie, A.L., 2014. The risk to New Zealand shellfish aquaculture from paralytic shellfish
604	poisoning (PSP) toxins. N. Z. J. Mar. Freshwater Res. 48(3), 430-465.
605	
606	MacKenzie, L., Todd, K., 2002. Alexandrium camurascutulum sp. nov. (Dinophyceae): a new
607	dinoflagellate species from New Zealand. Harmful Algae 1(3), 295-300.
608	
609	MacKenzie, L., de Salas, M., Adamson, J., Beuzenberg, V., 2004. The dinoflagellate genus
610	Alexandrium (Halim) in New Zealand coastal waters: comparative morphology, toxicity and molecular
611	genetics. Harmful Algae 3(1), 71–92.
612	
613	Matsuoka, K., Fukuyo, Y., 2000. Technical guide for modern dinoflagellate cyst study. WESTPAC-
614	HAB/WESTPAC/IOC, Japan Society of the Promotion Science, Tokyo, 29 p.
615	
616	Menezes, M., Branco, S., Miotto, M.C., Alves-de-Souza, C., 2018. The Genus Alexandrium
617	(Dinophyceae, Dinophyta) in Brazilian Coastal Waters. Front. Mar. Sci. 5, p. 421.
618	
619	Moestrup, Ø., Akselmann-Cardella, R., Churro, C., Fraga, S., Hoppenrath, M., Iwataki, M., Larsen, J.,
620	Lundholm, N., Zingone, A. (Eds.), 2009 onwards. IOC-UNESCO Taxonomic Reference List of
621	Harmful Micro Algae. Accessed at http://www.marinespecies.org/hab on 2020-02-20.
622	doi:10.14284/362
623	

- 624 Montresor, M., Zingone, A., Marino, D., 1993. The paratabulate resting cyst of Alexandrium
- 625 pseudogonyaulax (Dinophyceae). In: Smayda, T.J., Shimizu, Y. (Eds), Toxic Phytoplankton Blooms
- 626 in the Sea. Elsevier, pp. 159–164.
- 627
- 628 Montresor, M., Zingone, A., Sarno, D., 1998. Dinoflagellate cyst production at a coastal
- 629 Mediterranean site. J. Plankton Res. 20, 2291–2312.
- 630
- 631 Montresor, M., John, U., Beran, A., Medlin, L.K., 2004. *Alexandrium tamutum* sp. nov.
- 632 (Dinophyceae): a new nontoxic species in the genus *Alexandrium*. J. Phycol. 40, 398–411.
- 633
- 634 Murray, S.A., Hoppenrath, M., Orr, R.J., Bolch, C., John, U., Diwan, R., Yauwenas, R., Harwood, T.,
- de Salas, M., Neilan, B., Hallegraeff, G., 2014. Alexandrium diversaporum sp. nov., a new non-
- 636 saxitoxin producing species: Phylogeny, morphology and *sxtA* genes. Harmful Algae 31, 54–65.
- 637
- Murray, S.A., Diwan, R., Orr, R.J., Kohli, G.S., John, U., 2015. Gene duplication, loss and selection in
 the evolution of saxitoxin biosynthesis in alveolates. Mol. Phylogenetics Evol. 92, 165–180.
- 640
- 641 Nagai, S., Itakura, S., Matsuyama, Y., Kotani, Y., 2003. Encystment under laboratory conditions of
- 642 the toxic dinoflagellate Alexandrium tamiyavanichii (Dinophyceae) isolated from the Seto Inland Sea,
- 643 Japan. Phycologia 42, 646–653.
- 644
- 645 Nagai, S., Nishitani, G., Takano, Y., Yoshida, M., Takayama, H., 2009. Encystment and excystment
- 646 under laboratory conditions of the nontoxic dinoflagellate *Alexandrium fraterculus* (Dinophyceae)
- 647 isolated from the Seto Inland Sea, Japan. Phycologia 48, 177–185.
- 648
- 649 Nagai, S., Chen, H., Kawakami, Y., Yamamoto, K., Sildever, S., Kanno, N., Oikawa, H., Yasuike, M.,
- 650 Nakamura, Y., Hongo, Y., Fujiwara, A., Kobayashi, T., Gojobori, T., 2019. Monitoring of the toxic

- dinoflagellate Alexandrium catenella in Osaka Bay, Japan using a massively parallel sequencing
 (MPS)-based technique. Harmful Algae 89, 101660.
 National Shellfish Sanitation Program. 2017. Guide for the Control of Molluscan Shellfish 2017
 Revision. Available at:
 http://www.fda.gov/Food/GuidanceRegulation/FederalStateFoodPrograms/ucm2006754.htm (last
 accessed 2 March 2020).
- 659 Orr, R.J., Stüken, A., Rundberget, T., Eikrem, W., Jakobsen, K.S., 2011. Improved phylogenetic
- resolution of toxic and non-toxic *Alexandrium* strains using a concatenated rDNA approach. Harmful
 Algae 10(6), 676–688.
- 662

663 Orr, R.J., Murray, S.A., Stüken A., Rhodes, L., Jakobsen, K.S., 2012. When naked became armored:

an eight-gene phylogeny reveals monophyletic origin of theca in dinoflagellates. PLoS One 7(11),

665 e50004. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0050004

666

667 Owen, K.C., Norris, D.R., 1985. Cysts and life cycle considerations of the thecate dinoflagellate
668 *Fragilidium*. J. Coast. Res. 1(3), 263–266.

669

670 Penna, A., Fraga, S., Masó, M., Giacobbe, M.G., Bravo, I., Garcés, E., Vila, M., Bertozzini, E.,

671 Andreoni, F., Luglie, A., 2008. Phylogenetic relationships among the Mediterranean Alexandrium

672 (Dinophyceae) species based on sequences of 5.8 S gene and Internal Transcript Spacers of the rRNA

673 operon. Eur. J. Phycol. 43(2), 163–178.

674

675 Rogers, J.E., Leblond, J.D., Moncreiff, C.A., 2006. Phylogenetic relationship of Alexandrium

676 monilatum (Dinophyceae) to other Alexandrium species based on 18S ribosomal RNA gene

677 sequences. Harmful Algae 5(3), 275–280.

679 Sanseverino, I., Conduto, D., Pozzoli, L., Dobricic, S., Lettieri, T., 2016. Algal bloom and its
680 economic impact; EUR 27905 EN; doi:10.2788/660478.

681

- 682 Shin, H.H., Baek, S.H., Li, Z., Han, M.-S., Oh, S.J., Youn, S.-H., Kim, Y.S., Kim, D., Lim, W.-A.
- 683 2014. Resting cysts, and effects of temperature and salinity on the growth of vegetative cells of the
- potentially harmful species *Alexandrium insuetum* Balech (Dinophyceae). Harmful Algae 39, 175–
 184.

686

- 687 Taylor, F.J.R., 1979. The toxigenic gonyaulacoid dinoflagellates. In: Taylor, D.L., Seliger, H.H.
- 688 (Eds.), Toxic dinoflagellate blooms. Proceedings of the Second International Conference on Toxic
- 689 Dinoflagellate Blooms, Key Biscayne, Florida, October 31–November 5, 1978, Elsevier/North-
- 690 Holland, New York pp. 47–56.
- 691
- 692 Taylor, F.J.R., Fukuyo, Y., 1998. The neurotoxigenic dinoflagellate genus *Alexandrium* Halim:
- 693 general introduction. In: *Physiological ecology of harmful algal blooms*. In: Anderson, D.M.,
- 694 Cembella, A.D., Hallegraeff, G.M. (Eds.), NATO ASI Series, vol. G 41, Springer-Verlag Berlin,
- 695 Heidelberg, pp. 283–317.

- Tillmann, U., John, U., 2002. Toxic effects of *Alexandrium* spp. on heterotrophic dinoflagellates: an
 allelochemical defence mechanism independent of PSP-toxin content. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser. 230, 47–
 58.
- 700
- 701 Trainer, V.L., Yoshida, T. (Eds.) 2014. Proceedings of the Workshop on Economic Impacts of
- Harmful Algal Blooms on Fisheries and Aquaculture. PICES Sci. Rep. No. 47, 85 p.
- 703
- 704 Turland, N.J., Wiersema, J.H., Barrie, F.R., Greuter, W., Hawksworth, D.L., Herendeen, P.S., Knapp,
- S., Kusber, W.-H., Li, D.-Z., Marhold, K., May, T.W., McNeill, J., Monro, A.M., Prado, J., Price, M.
- J., Smith, G.F. (Eds.) 2018. International Code of Nomenclature for algae, fungi, and plants (Shenzhen

- 707 Code) adopted by the Nineteenth International Botanical Congress Shenzhen, China, July 2017.
- 708 Regnum Vegetabile 159. Glashütten: Koeltz Botanical Books. DOI
- 709 https://doi.org/10.12705/Code.2018.
- 710
- 711 Turner, A.D., Dhanji-Rapkova, M., Fong, S.Y., Hungerford, J., McNabb, P.S., Boundy, M.J. and
- 712 Harwood, D.T., 2019. Ultrahigh-Performance Hydrophilic Interaction Liquid Chromatography with
- 713 Tandem Mass Spectrometry Method for the Determination of Paralytic Shellfish Toxins and
- 714 Tetrodotoxin in Mussels, Oysters, Clams, Cockles, and Scallops: Collaborative Study. *Journal of*
- 715 AOAC International, https://doi.org/10.5740/jaoacint.19-0240.
- 716
- 717 Walker, L.M., Steidinger, K.A., 1979. Sexual reproduction in the toxic dinoflagellate *Gonyaulax*
- 718 *monilata*. J. Phycol. 15, 312–315.
- 719
- Wall, D., Dale, B., 1969. The "hystrichosphaerid" resting spore of the dinoflagellate *Pyrodinium bahamense* Plate 1906. J. Phycol. 5, 140–149.
- 722
- 723 Wiese M., D'Agostino P.M., Mihali T.K., Moffitt M.C., Neilan B.A. 2010 Neurotoxic Alkaloids:
- 724 Saxitoxin and Its Analogs. Mar. Drugs 8(7), 2185–2211.
- 725
- 726 Yoshida, M., Mizushima, K., Matsuoka, K., 2003. Alexandrium acatenella (Gonyaulacales:
- Dinophyceae): Morphological characteristics of vegetative cell and resting cyst. Plankton Biol. Ecol.
 50(2), 61–64.
- 729
- Yuki, K., Fukuyo, Y., 1992. *Alexandrium satoanum* sp. nov. (Dinophyceae) from Matoya Bay, central
 Japan. J. Phycol. 28, 395–399.
- 732

- 733 Zurhelle, C., Nieva, J., Tillmann, U., Harder, T., Krock, B., Tebben, J., 2018. Identification of Novel
- 734 Gymnodimines and Spirolides from the Marine Dinoflagellate *Alexandrium ostenfeldii*. Mar. Drugs.
- **735** 16(11), 446, doi: 10.3390/md16110446.

Table 1: A summary of published <i>Alexandrium</i> phylogeneties carried out with different DNA regions; reference of the study, figure number
in that study, basal species mentioned (question marks denote uncertainty), and accessory notes. ND: the basal species cannot be determined
because the authors chose <i>Alexandrium</i> species as the outgroup.

DNA region	Reference	Fig	Basal species	Note
SSU	Gómez and Artigas (2019)	Fig. 4	A. satoanum, A. monilatum, A.	
			taylorii, A. pseudogoniaulax	
	John et al. (2003)	Fig. 1	A. taylorii	
	Rogers et al. (2006)	Fig. 2	A. monilatum, A. taylorii	
	Li et al. (2019)	Fig. S1	A. pseudogonyaulax	
LSU	Orr et al. (2011)	Fig. 1	A. minutum, A. insuetum, A.	
			ostenfeldii, A. tamutum, A.	
			leei?	
	Li et al. (2019)	Fig. S2	A. minutum, A. ostenfeldii, A.	
			andersonii, A. tamutum, A.	
			insuetum, A.	
			pseudogonyaulax?	
LSU D1/D2	Gómez and Artigas (2019)	Fig. 5	A. leei	
	John et al. (2003)	Fig. 1	A. taylorii	
	Leaw et al. (2005)	Fig. 2	A. leei	Pyrodinium nests
				within
				Alexandrium
	Anderson et al. (2012)	Fig. 1	A. leei (+ A. satoanum, A.	
			pseudogonyaulax, A. hiranoi,	
			A. taylorii)?	
	Baggesen et al. (2012)	Fig. 3	ND	
	Gu et al. (2013)	Fig. 5	A. insuetum, A. minutum, A.	
			tamutum, A. ostenfeldii, A.	
	1 (2010)		margalefii, A. leei?	
7770 ·	Menezes et al. (2018)	Fig. 5	ND	
ITS region	Gu et al. (2013)	Fig. 5	A. leei	
	Menezes et al. (2018)	Fig. 4	A. margalefii	
	Li et al. (2019)	Fig. S3	A. pseudogonyaulax	
SSU+ITS region+LSU	Orr et al. (2011)	Fig. 2	A. ostenfeldii, A. andersonii,	
			A. tamutum, A. leei, A.	
	M (2014)	F' 0	insuetum?	
	Murray et al. (2014)	Fig. 8	A. hiranoi, A.	
			pseudogonyaulax, A. taylorii,	
	$C_{\text{off}} = 1$ (2018)	E a 4	A. monilatum, A. satoanum	Coolia nests
	Gottschling et al. (2018)	Fig. 4	A. margalefii	within
				Alexandrium
SSU+ITS	Li et al. (2019)	Fig. 10	A. pseudogonyaulax	механатит
region+LSU+cox1+cob+hsp90	Li et al. (2019)	Fig. 10	A. pseudogonyaulax	
SSU+ITS region+LSU+actin+beta-	Murray et al. (2015)	Fig. 8	A. insuetum, A. ostenfeldii, A.	
tubulin+cytochrome b+cox1+hsp90		0.1	andersonii, A. tamutum, A.	
,			minutum, A. margalefii, A.	
			leei, A. diversaporum	

Table 2: Summary of characters discussed in the text: name of taxon used in Gómez and Artigas (2019), species name, contact between plate 1' and Po, shape of plate 1', and resting cyst morphology. 1 = Balech, 1995; 2 = Balech, 1989; 3 = Lim et al., 2015; 4 = Montresor et al., 2004; 5 = John et al., 2014; 6 = Murray et al., 2014; 7 = MacKenzie and Todd, 2002; 8 = Gaarder, 1954; 9 = Larsen and Nguyen-Ngoc, 2004; 10 = Yuki and Fukuyo, 1992; 11 = Li et al., 2019; 12 = Fukuyo, 1985, as *A. catenella*; 13 = Delgado et al., 1997; 14 = Montresor et al., 1998; 15 = Shin et al., 2014; 16 = Bravo et al., 2006; 17 = Bolch et al., 1991; 18 = Kremp et al., 2009; 19 = Montresor et al., 2004; 20 = Yoshida et al., 2003; 21 = Anderson and Wall, 1978; 22 = Fukuyo and Pholpuntin, 1990a; 23 = Nagai et al., 2009; 24 = Fukuyo and Pholpuntin, 1990b; 25 = Nagai et al., 2003; 26 = Fukuyo and Inoue, 1990; 27 = Garret et al., 2011; 28 = Kita et al., 1993; 29 = Walker and Steidinger 1979; 30 = Montresor et al., 1993. 31 = Branco et al., 2020. * = not all strains produce saxitoxins. # = most strains do not produce saxitoxins. & = although also placed in *Alexandrium s.s.* by Gómez and Artigas (2019).

although also placed in <i>Alexandrium s.s.</i> by Gómez and Artigas (2019).						
Taxon used in Gómez and Artigas (2019)	Species name	Contact between plate 1' and Po	Shape of plate 1'	Resting cyst morphology		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. andersonii	Direct or indirect ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ¹⁴		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. diversaporum	Direct ⁶	Pentagonal ⁶	Spherical ⁶		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. insuetum	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ¹⁵		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. margalefii	None ¹	Quadrangular ¹	Spherical ¹⁶		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. minutum	Direct or indirect ²	Pentagonal ¹	Discoid ¹⁷		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. ostenfeldii	Direct or indirect ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ¹⁸		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. pohangense	None ³	Pentagonal ³	-		
Alexandrium s.s.	A. tamutum	Direct ⁴	Pentagonal ⁴	Discoid ¹⁹		
Protogonyaulax	A. acatenella	Direct or indirect ²	Pentagonal ¹	Ellipsoidal ²⁰		
Protogonyaulax	A. australiense	Direct ⁵	Pentagonal ⁵	Ellipsoidal ⁵		
Protogonyaulax	A. catenella	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Ellipsoidal ²¹		
Protogonyaulax	A. cohorticula	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Ellipsoidal ²²		
Protogonyaulax	A. compressum	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	-		
Protogonyaulax	A. fraterculus	Direct or indirect ²	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical to ovoid ²³		
Protogonyaulax	A. kutnerae	Direct or indirect ²	Pentagonal ¹	Ellipsoidal ¹⁶		
Protogonyaulax ^{&}	A. leei	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ²⁴		
Protogonyaulax	A. mediterraneum	Direct ⁵	Pentagonal ⁵	Ellipsoidal ⁵		
Protogonyaulax	A. pacificum	Direct ⁵	Pentagonal ¹²	Ellipsoidal ¹²		
Protogonyaulax	A. tamarense	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Ellipsoidal ²¹		
Protogonyaulax	A. tamiyavanichii	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ²⁵		
Protogonyaulax	A. tropicale	Direct or indirect ¹	Pentagonal ¹	-		
Episemicolon	A. affine	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ²⁶		
Episemicolon	A. gaarderae	Direct ¹	Pentagonal ¹	-		
Gessnerium	A. balechii	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical ²⁷		
Gessnerium	A. camurascutulum	None ⁷	Pentagonal ⁷	-		
Gessnerium	A. concavum	None ⁸	Pentagonal ⁸	-		
Gessnerium	A. foedum	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	-		
Gessnerium	A. globosum	None ⁹	Pentagonal9	-		
Gessnerium	A. hiranoi	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Discoid ²⁸		
Gessnerium	A. monilatum	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical to ovoid ²⁹		
Gessnerium	A. pseudogonyaulax	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹	Spherical, paratabulate ³⁰		
Gessnerium	A. satoanum	None ¹⁰	Pentagonal ¹⁰ Quadrangular-	-		
Gessnerium	A. taylorii	None ¹	Pentagonal ¹³	Spherical to discoid ¹⁶		
Not listed	A. depressum	Direct or indirect8	Pentagonal ⁸	-		
Not listed	A. fragae	Direct or indirect ³¹	Pentagonal ³¹	-		
Centrodinium	C. punctatum	Direct ¹¹	Quadrangular ¹¹	-		