



HAL
open science

Revisiting Koch's postulate to determine the plausibility of viral transmission by human milk

Philippe van de Perre, Jean-pierre Molès, Nicolas Nagot, Edouard Tuaille,
Pierre-emmanuel Ceccaldi, Ameena Goga, Andrew J Prendergast, Nigel
Rollins

► To cite this version:

Philippe van de Perre, Jean-pierre Molès, Nicolas Nagot, Edouard Tuaille, Pierre-emmanuel Ceccaldi, et al.. Revisiting Koch's postulate to determine the plausibility of viral transmission by human milk. *Pediatric Allergy and Immunology*, 2021, 10.1111/pai.13473 . hal-03154779

HAL Id: hal-03154779

<https://hal.umontpellier.fr/hal-03154779>

Submitted on 1 Mar 2021

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial - NoDerivatives 4.0 International License

Revisiting Koch's postulate to determine the plausibility of viral transmission by human milk

Philippe Van de Perre^a, MD, PhD, Jean-Pierre Molès^a, PhD, Nicolas Nagot^a, MD, PhD, Edouard Tuailon^a, MD, PhD, Pierre-Emmanuel Ceccaldi^b, MD, PhD, Ameena Goga^{c,d}, MD, PhD, Andrew J. Prendergast^{e,f}, MD, PhD, Nigel Rollins^g, MD, PhD

Affiliations:

^a Pathogenesis and control of chronic and emerging infections, University of Montpellier, INSERM, Etablissement Français du Sang, Antilles University; CHU Montpellier, Montpellier, France

^b Unité Epidémiologie et Physiopathologie des Virus Oncogènes, Institut Pasteur, Université de Paris, CNRS UMR 3569, Paris, France

^c HIV Prevention Research Unit, South African Medical Research Council, Cape Town, South Africa

^d Department of Paediatrics and Child Health, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

^e Blizard Institute, Queen Mary University of London, UK

^f Zvitambo Institute for Maternal and Child Health Research, Harare, Zimbabwe

^g Department of Maternal, Newborn, Child and Adolescent Health and Ageing, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland

Running title: Viral transmission by human milk

Address correspondence to: Professor Philippe Van de Perre, MD, PhD, UMR 1058 "Pathogenesis and Control of Chronic and Emerging Infections", INSERM - Université Montpellier – EFS – Antilles University
Inserm ADR Languedoc-Roussillon, 60 rue de Navacelles 34394 Montpellier Cedex 5, France.
Tel.: +33(0)6 75 82 25 81 E-mail : p-van_de_perre@chu-montpellier.fr

Word count: Text: 2199 words Abstract: 238 words

References: 80 (justified by the number of criteria to be validated for each human virus)

This article has been accepted for publication and undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the [Version of Record](#). Please cite this article as [doi: 10.1111/PAI.13473](https://doi.org/10.1111/PAI.13473)

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

Table: 1

1

2 PROFESSOR PHILIPPE VAN DE PERRE (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-3912-0427)

3 DR JEAN-PIERRE MOLÈS (Orcid ID : 0000-0001-9446-3521)

4

5

6 Article type : Rostrum

7

8

9 **i. Conflict of Interest Disclosures (including financial disclosures):** None of the authors
10 have conflict of interest to disclose.

11 **ii. Financial support:** No funding was secured for this study.

12 **iii. Abstract and keywords**

13 As breastfeeding is of utmost importance for child development and survival, identifying
14 whether breast milk is a route of transmission for human viruses is critical.

15 Based on the principle of Koch's postulate, we propose an analytical framework to determine
16 the plausibility of viral transmission by breast milk. This framework is based on five criteria:
17 viral infection in children receiving breastmilk from infected mothers; the presence of virus,
18 viral antigen or viral genome in the breast milk of infected mothers; the evidence for the virus
19 in breast milk being infectious; the attempts to rule out other transmission modalities; and the
20 reproduction of viral transmission by oral inoculation in an animal model. We searched for
21 evidence in published reports to determine whether the 5 criteria are fulfilled for 16 human
22 viruses that are suspected to be transmissible by breast milk. We considered breast milk
23 transmission is proven if all 5 criteria are fulfilled, as probable if 4 of the 5 criteria are met, as
24 possible if 3 of the 5 criteria are fulfilled and as unlikely if less than 3 criteria are met. Only
25 five viruses have proven transmission through breast milk: human T-cell lymphotropic virus
26 1, human immunodeficiency virus, human cytomegalovirus, dengue virus and Zika virus. The
27 other 11 viruses fulfilled some but not all criteria and were categorized accordingly.

28 Our framework analysis is useful for guiding public health recommendations and for
29 identifying knowledge gaps amenable to original experiments.

30 **Keywords:** breast milk, viral transmission, plausibility, Koch's postulate, analytical framework

31 **iv. Key Message**

32 This report will inform pediatricians and immunologists on the existence of viral transmission
33 by breast milk, alleviate public anxiety regarding potential transmission, identify knowledge
34 gaps amenable to original experiments and enrich the debate on how to encourage best
35 practice of infant feeding while preventing breastfeeding transmission of human viruses.

36

37 **v. Main text**

38 **Introduction**

39 Exclusive breastfeeding in the first six months of life and continued breastfeeding for at least
40 24 months, is the optimal feeding mode for infants and children. Breastfeeding not only
41 provides optimal nutrition but also contributes significantly to child survival, lifelong health
42 and development. ¹ Breast milk contains a multitude of biologically active substances
43 (including antibodies, cytokines, anti-infectious agents, cell growth factors, complex lipids,
44 immunomodulating oligosaccharides and complement) and maternal cells that confer
45 benefits to enable these outcomes. ² It is now understood that the fragile neonatal immune
46 system only becomes fully competent if it is complemented by components of the maternal
47 immune system transferred through breastfeeding during the first few weeks postpartum so
48 called “fourth trimester of pregnancy”. The interactions and intimacy between mother and
49 infant through breastfeeding also support neuropsychological maturation and early childhood
50 development.

51 However, in some very specific conditions, breast milk and breastfeeding can be important
52 routes for viral transmission. For at least three human viruses – the human T-cell
53 lymphotropic virus 1 (HTLV-I), the human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) and the human
54 cytomegalovirus (CMV) – breastfeeding contributes to mother-to-child transmission. Several
55 other human viruses have also been hypothesized to be transmitted through breast milk or
56 by breastfeeding because of observations such as the presence of viral particles or viral
57 genomes in breast milk or the acquisition of the infection by infants fed by mothers with
58 confirmed infection. For many of these viruses, the experimental or observational data linked
59 to actual transmission remain piecemeal and incomplete, rendering the causality of the
60 relationship still elusive. Definitive proof of a causal link between the infant feeding modality
61 and infectious risk is particularly difficult to ascertain and is presently not based on a
62 consensus framework for the interpretation of evidence.

63 The portal of entry for milk-borne viruses in the breastfed infant remains to be fully clarified
64 but may involve tonsils, pharyngeal mucosae and digestive tract mucosae, including
65 enterocytes and Peyer’s patches. ^{3,4} Various mechanisms are used by human viruses to
66 cross infant’s mucosae and establish infection, including direct translocation facilitated by
67 breaches in the mucosal integrity, cell-to-cell transfer via virological synapses, transcytosis
68 across M cells or enterocytes, or possibly by breastfeeding-induced microchimerism. ³⁻⁷

69 Differentiating transmission through breast milk – as a result of ingesting milk containing the
70 virus – from breastfeeding transmission which might also include other transmission routes
71 (airborne, droplets, skin or mucous contacts, blood borne, vector borne) due to proximity

72 with the mother during feeding – is challenging. A recent example of such difficult and
73 inconsistent interpretation of evidence was generated during the Coronavirus disease 19
74 (Covid-19) pandemic. Studies reported that severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus
75 type 2 (SARS-CoV-2) can be transmitted by approximately 10% of infected pregnant women
76 to their offspring, in utero or in the first weeks of life.⁸ Also, SARS-CoV-2 RNA has been
77 detected in the breast milk of lactating mothers with confirmed SARS-CoV-2 infection and
78 mild Covid-19 symptoms.⁹ Whether breast milk and/or breastfeeding transmission of SARS-
79 CoV-2 is possible and, if so, whether this transmission represents a significant threat to
80 infant health remain to be demonstrated. This uncertainty has generated scientific
81 questioning and also anxiety in the public and a significant threat to infant feeding practices
82 worldwide. The World Health Organization has reviewed this evidence and released
83 recommendations but other national authorities and professional associations have not
84 always concurred with these guidelines.¹⁰

85 Here, we propose an analytical framework based on 5 criteria to help establish a causal
86 relationship between breast milk exposure and acquisition of viral infections in breastfed
87 infants. Based on revisiting the concept of Koch's postulate, this analytical framework should
88 help refine health policies regarding infant feeding and infectious risk and stimulate research
89 to fill the gaps in order to confirm or refute breast milk transmission of specific human
90 viruses.

91 **The analytical framework**

92 The first Koch's postulate was proposed in 1876 by Robert Hermann Koch in a pioneering
93 attempt to establish the causative relationship between a microbe and a disease. In its initial
94 form (followed by many revisions) the postulate included the following four criteria:

95- The microorganism must be found in abundance in all organisms suffering from the disease,
96 but should not be found in healthy organisms;

97- The microorganism must be isolated from a diseased organism and grown in pure culture;

98- The cultured microorganism should cause disease when introduced into a healthy organism;

99- The microorganism must be re-isolated from the inoculated, diseased experimental host and
100 identified as being identical to the original specific causative agent.¹¹

101 The postulate implies that the demonstration of the presence of an infectious agent in a
102 patient affected by the disease is not sufficient to infer a causal relationship. In that sense,
103 Koch's postulate is considered as a founding concept of modern evidence-based medicine.
104 Koch's postulate focused particularly on acute disease causation, as chronic viral infections
105 were clearly not a concern at that time. One hundred and forty four years later, the principle
106 of the postulate, – the fulfilment of criteria, each of them contributing to a final inference of

107 causality – remains however perfectly valid. Breast milk transmission of viruses is complex
108 as it often involves a mother with no disease and an infant who may acquire infection with no
109 signs of disease. The immense advantage today over the situation in 1876 results from
110 spectacular advancements in the tools offered by medical research to ascertain evidence.
111 Applying the underlying principles of Koch's postulate with a common framework for
112 interpretation of evidence would help determine with confidence whether a given virus is
113 transmissible by a specific route.

114 We propose that transmission of a human virus by breast milk is considered proven if the
115 five following elements are all demonstrated:

**1161. There is evidence for viral infection in infants receiving breastmilk from infected
117 mothers**

118 Epidemiologic observations that substantiate transmission occurs from mother to child,
119 possibly through breastfeeding, based on evidence of infant infection by means of direct or
120 indirect assays.

1212. Virus, viral antigen or viral genome are present in the breast milk of infected mothers

122 The presence of viral particle, viral antigen or viral genome or infected cells in breast milk
123 may reflect either viral replication within breast milk or the mammary gland, extravasation of
124 viruses from the vascular compartment, attraction of infected cells into the mammary gland
125 or milk - as an effector site of the mucosal immune system –, clinical contamination during
126 collection of breast milk or a laboratory contaminant. ⁴ In certain circumstances, local
127 humoral response to the virus may be also interesting to explore as it may mitigate viral
128 shedding. ¹²

1293. The virus in breast milk is infectious

130 The capacity for a virus identified in breast milk to cause infection can be confirmed if the
131 virus can replicate *in vitro* in cell culture, in tissue explants or in organoids. In case of highly
132 diverging viruses (usually RNA viruses), viral infectiousness can be indirectly inferred if the
133 virus present in breast milk and the virus isolated in the infant are indistinguishable (at least
134 95% genetically identical). Also, a cytotoxic response to viral epitopes of some viruses
135 demonstrated in breast milk can also be considered as strongly suggesting local virus
136 replication.

**1374. Reasonable attempts have been made to rule out other relevant transmission routes
138 (e.g. by transplacental, airborne droplets, arthropod bites and blood borne routes)
139 potentially associated with breastfeeding**

140 Most frequently, this can be assessed in carefully described case reports, case series or
141 cohorts. Other routes of mother-to-child transmission can be potentially ruled out by
142 demonstrating the absence of virus detection in cord blood and/or the birth canal or by

143 demonstrating a risk reduction by avoidance of breastfeeding (strict replacement feeding) or
144 by viral inactivation of expressed breast milk (pasteurization, freezing-thawing ...).

1455. **Transmission by breast milk can be reproduced by oral inoculation in an animal
146 model.**

147 The animal model can convincingly contribute to the hypothesis of breast milk transmission if
148 infection is demonstrated in new-born animals breastfed by infected mothers, although
149 transmission through close contact with the mother can never be ruled out in this model, or
150 after oral inoculation by means of milk containing the virus. Oral inoculation by means of
151 culture supernatant or concentrated infected cells is less convincing, as it is not reproducing
152 the complex composition of breast milk and its interactions with viable viruses.

153 In order to challenge this analytical framework, we searched for evidence in published
154 reports to determine whether the 5 criteria are fulfilled or not for 16 human viruses that are
155 suspected to be transmissible by breast milk.^{6,8,9,13-78} According to the literature search,
156 information can be found to validate or not the criteria for these viruses, although this
157 information is sometimes scarce or incomplete. As an example, animal model exists for
158 almost all 16 viruses but few of these models have been challenged by the oral route and a
159 fortiori by breast milk.¹³

160 We considered breast milk transmission is proven if all 5 criteria are fulfilled, as probable if 4
161 of the 5 criteria are met, as possible if 3 of the 5 criteria are fulfilled and as unlikely if fewer
162 than 3 criteria are met. If at least two criteria were not reported, viral transmission by breast
163 milk was considered as insufficiently documented. According to this analytical framework
164 (see Table), transmissibility through breast milk is proven for only five of the selected human
165 viruses. Not surprisingly, three of them - HTLV-1, HIV and CMV - are generally considered
166 as the prototypes of human viruses transmissible by breast milk.^{13, 15, 16} However for the
167 other two, dengue virus (DENV) and Zika virus (ZIKV) transmissibility through breast milk
168 was not previously considered proven despite reasonably strong evidence to support
169 transmission. Three human viruses – Ebola virus (EBOV), West Nile virus (WNV) and the
170 recently studied Andes virus (ANDV), the only hantavirus transmitted between humans by
171 close contacts¹⁷ - are probably transmissible through breast milk. For each of them, the gap
172 in knowledge that needs to be filled by experimental evidence is identified and discussed
173 (see Table). Yellow fever virus (YFV, vaccine strain 17D), Epstein-Barr virus (EBV) and
174 hepatitis E virus (HEV) are judged as only possibly transmissible by breast milk. For YFV,
175 the virus or its genome has never been detected in breast milk and no animal model has
176 been used so far to replicate oral challenge. For EBV, routes of transmission other than
177 breast milk cannot be ruled out and the animal model for breast milk transmission is
178 insufficiently convincing.¹⁸ Two viruses – Chikungunya virus (CHIKV) and SARS-CoV-2 –

179 are considered as unlikely candidates for breast milk transmission. Finally, herpes simplex
180 virus (HSV), hepatitis C virus (HCV) and hepatitis B virus (HBV) transmission by breast milk
181 is insufficiently documented, as it may be for other human viruses than the 16 selected, such
182 as Tick-Borne Encephalitis Virus.¹⁹

183 **Conclusions**

184 Over recent years, outbreaks of emerging or re-emerging viral infections have raised the
185 question of transmission through breast milk and breastfeeding. As unknowns create anxiety
186 and may impact feeding practices inappropriately, we believe our analytical framework
187 contributes an important step in the process by which health policy for infant feeding is made
188 in the context of human virus outbreaks. A drawback of our analytical framework may result
189 from the 5 criteria having not equal weight in predicting transmission. For example, if
190 substituting formula for breast milk clearly reduces the risk of transmission of a pathogenic
191 virus – an effect measured in randomized clinical trials on very few viral infections so far,
192 such as HIV²⁶ -, do we need tissue culture infection or an animal model before we can make
193 public health decision? Also, viruses co-infecting breast milk may interfere with each other
194 for viral shedding. In a study of HIV-1-infected breastfeeding women in Zimbabwe, breast
195 milk CMV and EBV levels (reflecting local reactivation) were independently associated with
196 detection of breast milk HIV-1 RNA.⁷⁹

197 It has to be stressed that demonstration of breast milk transmission of a virus alone does not
198 necessarily require or imply preventive interventions and does not justify that infection with
199 this organisms is a contraindication to breastfeeding; recommendations on infant feeding
200 must consider several other individual and societal-level factors such as the frequency and
201 severity of the viral infection in infants, the social and environmental context (social norms,
202 burden of infectious diseases, access to water and sanitation) and health and development
203 cost of not breastfeeding for the individual child, and the background morbidity and mortality
204 profiles within that context. For many of these viruses, even if breast milk transmission is
205 confirmed, the risk of not breastfeeding largely outweigh the risk of transmitting the virus to
206 the infant. Some of these viruses, such as CMV in non preterm infants, induce only
207 asymptomatic or benign disease and do not therefore justify avoidance of breastfeeding or
208 necessitate an alternative infant feeding practice.⁸⁰

209 By pinpointing gaps in knowledge that urgently need evidence generation, our analytical
210 framework is also important for decision making on scientific agendas in order to decipher
211 mechanisms of transmission and confirm or refute breast milk transmission of viruses.
212 Similar frameworks and exercises should be conceptualized and undertaken to ascertain the

213 level of evidence for other modes of viral transmission such as sexual transmission or
214 horizontal transmission of specific viruses including HCV and arboviruses.

215

216 **v. Acknowledgements**

217

218 **vi. References**

- 219 1. Neovita Study Group. Timing of initiation, patterns of breastfeeding, and infant survival:
220 prospective analysis of pooled data from three randomised trials. *Lancet Glob Health*
221 2016;4(4):e266-275.
- 222 2. Lepage P, Van de Perre P. The immune system of breast milk: antimicrobial and anti-
223 inflammatory properties. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 2012;743:121-137.
- 224 3. Prendergast AJ, Goga AE, Waitt C, Gessain A, Taylor GP, Rollins N, Abrams EJ, Lyall
225 EH, Van de Perre P. Transmission of CMV, HTLV-1, and HIV through breastmilk. *Lancet*
226 *Child Adolesc Health* 2019;3: 264-273.
- 227 4. Van de Perre P, Rubbo PA, Viljoen J, Nagot N, Tylleskär T, Lepage P, Vendrell JP,
228 Tuailon E. HIV-1 reservoirs in breast milk and Translational Challenges in Eliminating HIV-1
229 transmission through breastfeeding. *Sci Transl Med* 2012;4: 143sr3.
- 230 5. Alfsen A, Yu H, Magérus-Chatinet A, Schmitt A, Bomsel M. HIV-1-infected blood
231 mononuclear cells form an integrin- and agrin-dependent viral synapse to induce efficient
232 HIV-1 transcytosis across epithelial cell monolayer. *Mol. Biol Cell* 2005;16:4267–4279.
- 233 6. Percher F, Jeannin P, Martin-Latil S, Gessain A, Afonso PV, Vidy-Roche A, Ceccaldi PE.
234 Mother-to-Child Transmission of HTLV-1 Epidemiological Aspects, Mechanisms and
235 Determinants of Mother-to-Child Transmission. *Viruses* 2016; 8:40.
- 236 7. Molès JP, Tuailon E, Kankasa C, Bedin AS, Nagot N, Marchant A, McDermid JM, Van de
237 Perre P. Breast milk cells trafficking induces microchimerism-mediated immune system
238 maturation in the infant. *Pediatr Allergy Immunol* 2018; 29:133-143.
- 239 8. Walker KF, O'Donoghue K, Grace N, Dorling J, Comeau JL, Li W, Thornton JG. Maternal
240 transmission of SARS-COV-2 to the neonate, and possible routes for such transmission: A
241 systematic review and critical analysis [published online June 12, 2020]. *Obstet Gynaecol*
242 2020: doi:10.1111/1471-0528.16362
- 243 9. Groß R, Conzelmann C, Müller JA, Stenger S, Steinhart K, Kirchhoff F, Münch J.
244 Detection of SARS-CoV-2 in human breastmilk. *Lancet* 2020;395:757–758.
- 245 10. Yeo KT, Oei JL, De Luca D, Schmolzer GM, Guaran R, Palasanthiran P, Kumar K,
246 Buonocore G, Cheong J, Owen LS, Kusuda S, James J, Lim G, Sharma A, Uthaya S, Gale
247 C, Whittaker E, Battersby C, Modi N, Norman M, Naver L, Giannoni E, Diambomba Y, Shah
248 PS, Gagliardi L, Harrison M, Pillay S, Alburayy A, Yuan Y, Zhang H. Review of guidelines
249 and recommendations from 17 countries highlights the challenges that clinicians face caring

- 250 for neonates born to mothers with COVID-19 [published online July 27, 2020]. *Acta*
251 *Paediatrica* 2020: doi: 10.1111/apa.15495
- 252 11. Koch R. Untersuchungen über Bakterien: V. Die Ätiologie der Milzbrand-Krankheit
253 begründet auf die Entwicklungsgeschichte des *Bacillus anthracis*. *Cohns Beitrage zur*
254 *Biologie der Pflanzen* 1876;2:277–310.
- 255 12. Van de Perre P, Simonon A, Hitimana DG, Dabis F, Msellati P, Mukamabano B, Butera
256 JB, Van Goethem C, Karita E, Lepage P. Infective and anti-infective properties of breast milk
257 from HIV-1 infected mothers. *Lancet* 1993; 341:914-918.
- 258 13. Hino, S. Establishment of the milk-borne transmission as a key factor for the peculiar
259 endemicity of human T-lymphotropic virus type 1 (HTLV-1): The ATL Prevention Program
260 Nagasaki. *Proc Jpn Acad Ser B Phys Biol Sci* 2011;87:152–166.
- 261 14. Ruiz SI, Zumbrun EE, Nalca A. Chapter 33 - Animal Models of Human Viral Diseases. In
262 *Animal Models for the Study of Human Disease; Second Edition* 2017, 853–901 pp.
- 263 15. Van de Perre P, Simonon A, Msellati P, Hitimana DG, Vaira D, Bazubagira A, Van
264 Goethem C, Stevens AM, Karita E, Sondag-Thull D, Dabis F, Lepage P. Postnatal
265 transmission of human immunodeficiency virus type 1 from mother to infant. A prospective
266 cohort study in Kigali, Rwanda. *N Engl J Med* 1991;325:593-598.
- 267 16. Minamishima I; Ueda K; Minematsu T, Umemoto M, Take H, Kuraya K. Role of breast
268 milk in the acquisition of cytomegalovirus infection. *Microbiol Immunol* 1994;38:549-552.
- 269 17. Ferrés M, Martínez-Valdebenito C, Angulo J, Henríquez C, Vera-Otárola J, Vergara MJ,
270 Pérez J, Fernández J, Sotomayor V, Valdés MF, González-Candia D, Tischler ND, Vial C,
271 Vial P, Mertz G, Le Corre N. Mother-to-Child Transmission of Andes Virus through Breast
272 Milk, Chile. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2020;26:1885-1888.
- 273 18. Okuno K, Takashima K, Kanai K, Ohashi M, Hyuga R, Sugihara H, Kuwamoto S, Kato
274 M, Sano H, Sairenji T, Kanzaki S, Hayashi K. Epstein-Barr virus can infect rabbits by the
275 intranasal or peroral route: An animal model for natural primary EBV infection in humans. *J*
276 *Med Virol.* 2010;82:977-986.
- 277 19. Mann TZ, Haddad LB, Williams TR, Hills SL, Read JS, Dee DL, Dziuban EJ, Pérez-
278 Padilla J, Jamieson DJ, Honein MA, Shapiro-Mendoza CK. Breast Milk Transmission of
279 Flaviviruses in the Context of Zika Virus: A Systematic Review. *Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol*
280 2018;32: 358–368.

- 281 20. Kinoshita K, Hino S, Amagaski T, Ikeda S, Yamada Y, Suzuyama J, Momita S, Toriya K,
282 Kamihira S, Ichimaru M. Demonstration of adult T-cell leukemia virus antigen in milk from
283 three sero-positive mothers. *Jpn J Cancer Res* 1984;75:103-105.
- 284 21. Yamanouchi K, Kinoshita K, Moriuchi R, Ikeda S, Momita S, Amagasaki T, Soda H,
285 Ichimaru M, Katamine S, Miyamoto T. Oral infection of a common marmoset with human T-
286 cell leukemia virus type-I (HTLV-I) by inoculating fresh human milk of HTLV-I carrier
287 mothers. *Jpn J Cancer Res* 1985;76:481-487.
- 288 22. Uemura Y, Kotani S, Yoshimoto S, et al. Oral transmission of human T-cell leukemia
289 virus type I in the rabbit. *Jpn J Cancer Res* 1986;77:970-973.
- 290 23. Neveu D, Viljoen J, Bland RM, Nagot N, Danaviah S, Coutoudis A, Rollins NC,
291 Coovadia HM, Van de Perre P, Newell ML. Cumulative exposure to cell-free HIV in breast
292 milk rather than feeding pattern per se identifies postnatally infected infants. *Clin Infect Dis*
293 2011;52:819-825.
- 294 24. Ndirangu J, Viljoen J, Bland RM, , Danaviah S, Thorne C, Van de Perre P, Newell ML.
295 Cell-Free (RNA) and Cell-Associated (DNA) HIV-1 and Postnatal Transmission through
296 Breastfeeding. *PLoS One* 2012;7:e51493.
- 297 25. Thiry L, Sprecher-Goldberger S, Jonckheer T, Levy J, Van de Perre P, Henrivaux P,
298 Cogniaux-Leclerc J, Clumeck N. Isolation of AIDS virus from cell-free breast milk of three
299 healthy virus carriers. *Lancet*. 1985;2:891-892.
- 300 26. Nduati R, John G, Mbori-Ngacha D, Richardson B, Overbaugh J, Mwatha A, Ndinya-
301 Achola J, Bwayo J, Onyango FE, Highes J, Kreiss J. Effect of breastfeeding and formula
302 feeding on transmission of HIV-1: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA* 2000;283:1167-1174.
- 303 27. Ruprecht RM; Baba TW; Liska V; Ray NB, Martin LN, Murphey-Corb M, Rizvi TA,
304 Bernacky BJ, Keeling ME, McClure HM, Andersen J. Oral transmission of primate
305 lentiviruses. *J Infect Dis* 1999;179 Suppl 3:S408-412.
- 306 28. Hamprecht K, Goelz R. Postnatal Cytomegalovirus infection through human milk in
307 preterm infants: transmission, clinical presentation, and prevention. *Clin Perinatol*
308 2017;44:121-130.
- 309 29. Moylan DC, Pati SK, Ross SA, Fowler KB, Boppana SB, Sabbaj S. Breast milk human
310 cytomegalovirus (CMV) viral load and the establishment of breast milk CMV-pp65-specific
311 CD8 T cells in human CMV infected mothers. *J Infect Dis* 2017;216:1176-9.

- 312 30. Kaur A, Itell HL, Ehlinger EP, Varner V, Gantt S, Permar SR. Natural history of postnatal
313 rhesus cytomegalovirus shedding by dams and acquisition by infant rhesus monkeys. *PLoS*
314 *One* 2018;13:e0206330.
- 315 31. Antoine P, Varner V, Carville A, Connole M, Marchant A, Kaur A. Postnatal acquisition of
316 primary rhesus cytomegalovirus infection is associated with prolonged virus shedding and
317 impaired CD4⁺ T lymphocyte function. *J Infect Dis* 2014;210:1090–1099.
- 318 32. Arragain L, Dupont-Rouzeyrol M, O'Connor O, Sigur N, Grangeon JP, Huguon E,
319 Dechanet C, Cazorla C, Gourinat AC, Descloux E. Vertical Transmission of Dengue Virus in
320 the Peripartum Period and Viral Kinetics in Newborns and Breast Milk: New Data. *J Pediatric*
321 *Infect Dis Soc* 2017;6:324-331.
- 322 33. Barthel A, Gourinat AC, Cazorla C, Joubert C, Dupont-Rouzeyrol M, Descloux E. Breast
323 milk as a possible route of vertical transmission of dengue virus? *Clin Infect Dis*
324 2013;57:415-417.
- 325 34. Lee PX, Ong LC, Libau EA, Alonso S. Relative Contribution of Dengue IgG Antibodies
326 Acquired during Gestation or Breastfeeding in Mediating Dengue Disease Enhancement and
327 Protection in Type I Interferon Receptor-Deficient Mice. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis*
328 2016;10:e0004805.
- 329 35. Brueckner AL, Reagan RL, Yancey FS. Studies of dengue fever virus (Hawaii mouse
330 adapted) in lactating hamsters. *Am J Trop Med & Hyg* 1956;5:809–811.
- 331 36. Hoen B, Schaub B, Funk AL, Ardillon V, Boullard M, Cabié A, Callier C, Carles G,
332 Cassadou S, Césaire R, Douine M, Herrmann-Storck C, Kadhel P, Laouénan C, Madec Y,
333 Monthieux A, Nacher M, Najioullah F, Rousset D, Ryan C, Schepers K, Stegmann-
334 Planchard S, Tressières B, Voluménie JL, Yassinguez S, Janky E, Fontanet A. Pregnancy
335 Outcomes after ZIKV Infection in French Territories in the Americas. *N Engl J Med*
336 2018;378:985-994.
- 337 37. Dupont-Rouzeyrol M, Biron A, O'Connor O, Huguon E, Descloux E. Infectious Zika viral
338 particles in breastmilk. *Lancet* 2016;387:1051.
- 339 38. Sotelo JR, Sotelo AB, Sotelo FJB, Doi AM, Pinho JRR, Oliveira RC, Bezerra AMPS,
340 Deutsch AD, Villas-Boas LS, Felix AC, Romano CM, Machado CM, Mendes-Correa MCJ,
341 Santana RAF, Menezes FG, Manguiera CLP. Persistence of Zika Virus in Breast Milk after
342 Infection in Late Stage of Pregnancy. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2017;23:856-857.
- 343 39. Cavalcanti MG, Cabral-Castro MJ, Gonçalves JLS, Gonçalves JLS, Santana LS,
344 Pimenta ES, Peralta JM. Zika virus shedding in human milk during lactation: an unlikely
345 source of infection? *Int J Infect Dis* 2017;57:70-72.

- 346 40. Blohm GM, Lednicky JA, Márquez M, White SK, Loeb JC, Pacheco CA, Nolan DJ, Paisie
347 T, Salemi M, Rodríguez-Morales AJ, Glenn Morris J Jr, Pulliam JRC, Paniz-Mondolfi AE.
348 Evidence for Mother-to-Child Transmission of Zika Virus Through Breast Milk. *Clin Infect Dis*
349 2018;66:1120-1121.
- 350 41. Colt S, Garcia-Casal MN, Peña-Rosas JP, Finkelstein JL, Rayco-Solon P, Weise Prinzo
351 ZC, Mehta S. Transmission of Zika virus through breast milk and other breastfeeding-related
352 bodily-fluids: A systematic review. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 2017;11:e0005528.
- 353 42. Newman CM, Dudley DM, Aliota MT, Weiler AM, Barry GL, Mohns MS, Breitbach ME,
354 Stewart LM, Buechler CR, Graham ME, Post J, Schultz-Darken N, Peterson E, Newton W,
355 Mohr EL, Capuano S 3rd, O'Connor DH, Friedrich TC. Oropharyngeal mucosal transmission
356 of Zika virus in rhesus macaques. *Nat Commun* 2017;8:169.
- 357 43. Bradley MP, Nagamine CM. Animal Models of Zika Virus. *Comp Med*. 2017;67:242–25.
- 358 44. Sissoko D, Keïta M, Diallo B, Aliabadi N, Fitter DL, Dahl BA, Akoi Bore J, Raymond
359 Koundouno F, Singethan K, Meisel S, Enkirch T, Mazzarelli A, Amburgey V, Faye O, Alpha
360 Sall A, Magassouba N, Carroll MW, Anglaret X, Malvy D, Formenty P, Bruce Aylward R,
361 Keïta S, Harouna Djingarey M, Loman NJ, Günther S, Duraffour S. Ebola Virus Persistence
362 in Breast Milk After No Reported Illness: A Likely Source of Virus Transmission From Mother
363 to Child. *Clin Infect Dis* 2017; 64:513-516.
- 364 45. Nordenstedt H, Bah EI, de la Vega MA, Barry M, N'Faly M, Barry M, Crahay B, Decroo
365 T, Van Herp M, Ingelbeen B. Ebola Virus in Breast Milk in an Ebola Virus-Positive Mother
366 with Twin Babies, Guinea, 2015. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2016;22:759-760.
- 367 46. Bausch DG, Towner JS, Dowell SF, Kaducu F, Lukwiya M, Sanchez A, Nichol ST,
368 Ksiazek TG, Rollin PE. Assessment of the risk of Ebola virus transmission from bodily fluids
369 and fomites. *J Infect Dis* 2007;196:S142–147.
- 370 47. Logue J, Vargas Licona WV, Cooper TK, Reeder B, Byrum R, Qin J, Deiuliis Murphy N,
371 Cong Y, Bonilla A, Sword J, Weaver W, Kocher G, Olinger GG, Jahrling PB, Hensley LE,
372 Bennett RS. Ebola virus isolation using Huh-7 cells has methodological advantages and
373 similar sensitivity to isolation using other cell types and suckling BALB/c laboratory mice.
374 *Viruses* 2019;11:161.
- 375 48. de la Vega MA, Soule G, Tran KN, Tierney K, He S, Wong G, Qiu X, Kobinger GP.
376 Modeling Ebola Virus transmission using ferrets. *mSphere*. 2018;3:e00309-18.
- 377 49. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Possible West Nile virus
378 transmission to an infant through breast-feeding--Michigan, 2002. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep*
379 2002;51:877-878.

- 380 50. Reagan RL, Yancey FS, Chang SC, Brueckner AL. Transmission of West Nile (B956
381 strain) and Semliki Forest virus (MBB26146-M-404744-958 strain) to suckling hamsters
382 during lactation. *J Immunol* 1956;76:243-245.
- 383 51. Blázquez AB, Sáiz JC. West Nile virus (WNV) transmission routes in the murine model:
384 intrauterine, by breastfeeding and after cannibal ingestion. *Virus Res* 2010;151:240-243.
- 385 52. Witkowski PT, Perley CC, Brocato RL, Hooper JW, Jürgensen C, Schulzke JD, Krüger
386 DH, Bücken R. Gastrointestinal Tract As Entry Route for Hantavirus Infection. *Front Microbiol*
387 2017;8:1721.
- 388 53. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Transmission of yellow fever vaccine
389 virus through breast-feeding --- Brazil, 2009. *Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report* 2010; 59:130-132.
- 390 54. Junker AK, Thomas EE, Radcliffe A, Forsyth RB, Davidson AG, Rymo L. Epstein-Barr
391 virus shedding in breast milk. *Am J Med Sci* 1991;302:220-223.
- 392 55. Daud II, Coleman CB, Smith NA, Ogolla S, Simbiri K, Bukusi EA, Ng'ang'a ZW, Sumba
393 PO, Vulule J, Ploutz-Snyder R, Dent AE, Rochford R. Breast Milk as a Potential Source of
394 Epstein-Barr Virus Transmission Among Infants Living in a Malaria-Endemic Region of
395 Kenya. *J Infect Dis* 2015; 212:1735-1742.
- 396 56. Sanosyan A, Rutagwera D, Moles JP, Bolloré K, Periès M, Kankasa C, Mwiya M,
397 Tylleskär T, Nagot N, Van de Perre P, Tuillon E for the ANRS 12174 Trial Group.
398 Increased Epstein-Barr virus in breast milk occurs with subclinical mastitis and HIV
399 shedding. *Medicine (Baltimore)* 2016;95:e4005.
- 400 57. Verghese VP, Robinson JL. A systematic review of hepatitis E virus infection in children.
401 *Clin Infect Dis* 2014;59:689–697.
- 402 58. Rivero-Juarez A, Frias M, Rodriguez-Cano D, Cuenca-López F, Rivero A. Isolation of
403 hepatitis E virus from breast milk during acute infection. *Clin Infect Dis* 2016;62:1464.
- 404 59. Huang F, Li Y, Yu W, Jing S, Wang J, Long F, He Z, Yang C, Bi Y, Cao W, Liu C, Hua X,
405 Pan Q,. Excretion of infectious hepatitis E virus into milk in cows imposes high risks of
406 zoonosis. *Hepatology* 2016;64:350-359.
- 407 60. Wang L, Liu L, Wang L. An overview: Rabbit hepatitis E virus (HEV) and rabbit providing
408 an animal model for HEV study. *Reviews in Medical Virology* 2018;28:e1961.
- 409 61. Gérardin P, Barau G, Michault A, Bintner M, Randrianaivo H, Choker G, Lenglet Y,
410 Touret Y, Bouveret A, Grivard P, Le Roux K, Blanc S, Schuffenecker I, Couderc T,
411 Arenzana-Seisdedos F, Lecuit M, Robillard PY. Multidisciplinary Prospective Study of

412 Mother-to-Child Chikungunya Virus Infections on the Island of La Réunion. *PLoS Med*
413 2008;5:e60.

414 62. Campos GS, Albuquerque Bandeira AC, Diniz Rocha VF, Dias JP, Carvalho RH, Sardi
415 SI. First Detection of Chikungunya Virus in Breast Milk. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2017;36:1015–
416 1017.

417 63. Haese NN, Broeckel RM, Hawman DW, Heise MT, Morrison TE, Streblow DN. Animal
418 models for chikungunya virus infection and disease. *J Infect Dis* 2016;214:S482-488.

419 64. Lackey KA, Pace RM, Williams JE, Bode L, Donovan SM, Järvinen KM, Seppo AE,
420 Raiten DJ, Meehan CL, McGuire MA, McGuire MK. SARS-CoV-2 and human milk: What is
421 the evidence? *Matern Child Nutr* 2020; e13032.

422 65. Costa S, Posteraro B, Marchetti S, Tamburrini E, Carducci B, Lanzone A, Valentini P,
423 Buonsenso D, Sanguinetti M, Vento G, Cattani P. Excretion of Sars-Cov-2 in human
424 breastmilk samples. *Clin Microbiol Infect* 2020;26:1430–1432.

425 66. Chambers CD, Krogstad P, Bertrand K, Contreras D, Tobin NH, Bode L, Aldrovandi GM.
426 Evaluation of SARS-CoV-2 in breastmilk from 18 infected women. *Clinical Microbiology and*
427 *Infection* 2020;26:1430-1432.

428 67. Dunkle LM, Schmidt RR, O'Connor DM. Neonatal herpes simplex infection possibly
429 acquired via maternal breast milk. *Pediatrics* 1979;63:250-251.

430 68. Kotronias D, Kapranos N. Detection of herpes simplex virus DNA in maternal breast milk
431 by in situ hybridization with tyramide signal amplification. *In Vivo* 1999;13:463-466.

432 69. Sullivan-Bolyai JZ, Fife KH, Jacobs RF, Miller Z, Corey L. Disseminated neonatal herpes
433 simplex virus type 1 from a maternal breast lesion. *Pediatrics* 1983;71:455-457.

434 70. Kollias C, Huneke R, Wigdahl B, Jennings SR. Animal models of herpes simplex virus
435 immunity and pathogenesis. *J NeuroVirol* 2015;21:8-23.

436 71. Polywka S, Feucht H, Zöllner B, Laufs R. Hepatitis C virus infection in pregnancy and
437 the risk of mother-to-child transmission. *Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis* 1997;16:121-124.

438 72. Ogasawara S, Kage M, Kosai K, Shimamatsu K; Kojiro M. Hepatitis C virus RNA in
439 saliva and breastmilk of hepatitis C carrier mothers. *Lancet* 1993;341:561.

440 73. Kage M, Ogasawara S, Kosai K, Nakashima E, Shimamatsu K, Kojiro M, Kimura A,
441 Fujisawa T, Matsukuma Y, Ito Y, Kondo S, Kawano K, Sata M. Hepatitis C virus RNA
442 present in saliva but absent in breast-milk of the hepatitis C carrier mother. *J Gastroenterol*
443 *Hepatol* 1997;12:518-521.

- 444 74. Berggren KA, Suzuki S, Ploss A. Animal models used for hepatitis C virus research. *Int J*
445 *Mol Sci* 2020;21:3869.
- 446 75. Beasley RP, Stevens CE, Shiao IS, Meng HC. Evidence against breast-feeding as a
447 mechanism for vertical transmission of hepatitis B. *Lancet* 1975;2:740-741.
- 448 76. Shi Z., Yang Y., Wang H, Ma L, Schreiber A, Li X, Sun W, Zhao X, Yang X, Zhang L, Lu
449 W, Teng J, An Y. Breastfeeding of newborns by mothers carrying hepatitis B virus: a meta-
450 analysis and systematic review. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med* 2011;165:837-846.
- 451 77. Montoya-Ferrer A, Zorrilla AM, Viljoen J, Molès JP, Newell ML, Van de Perre P, Tuailon
452 E. High level of HBV DNA Virus in the breast milk seems not to contraindicate breastfeeding.
453 *Mediterr J Hematol Infect Dis* 2015;7:e2015042.
- 454 78. Guo WN, Zhu B, Ai L, Yang DL, Wang BJ. Animal model for the study of hepatitis B virus
455 infection. *Zool Res* 2018;39:25-31.
- 456 79. Gantt S, Carlsson J, Shetty AK, Seidel KD, Qin X, Mutsvangwa J, Musingwini G; Woelk
457 G; Zijenah LS; Katzenstein DA; Frenkel LM. Cytomegalovirus and Epstein-Barr virus in
458 breast milk are associated with HIV-1 shedding but not with mastitis. *AIDS* 2008; 22:1453–
459 1460.
- 460 80. Dworsky M, Yow M, Stagno S, Pass RF, Alford C. Cytomegalovirus infection of breast
461 milk and transmission in infancy. *Pediatrics* 1983;72:295-299.
- 462

viii. Table. Plausibility of viral transmission through breast milk: applying the framework to 16 human viruses

Human viruses	Criteria					Plausibility of transmission through breast milk*
	1 Evidence for infection in infants receiving breastmilk from infected mothers	2 Virus antigen or viral genome are present in breast milk from infected mothers	3 The virus in breast milk is infectious	4 Other transmission modalities can be ruled out	5 Transmission by breast milk can be reproduced in an animal model	
Human T-cell lymphotropic virus 1	Yes Percher et al (2016) ⁶ Hino et al (2011) ¹³	Yes Kinoshita et al (1984) ²⁰	Yes Kinoshita et al (1984) ²⁰	Yes, Absence of other risk factors, risk reduction by replacement feeding or freezing/thawing of breast milk Percher et al (2016) ⁶ Hino et al (2011) ¹³	Yes : Marmoset Yamanoushi et al (1985) ²¹ Rabbit Uemara et al (1986) ²²	Proven
Human	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Proven

immunodeficiency virus	Van de Perre et al (1991) ¹⁵	Neveu et al (2011) ²³ Ndirangu et al (2012) ²⁴	Thiry et al (1985) ²⁵	Mothers infected post partum Van de Perre et al (1991) ¹⁵ Risk reduction by replacement feeding Nduati et al (2000) ²⁶	Non human primates Ruprecht et al (1998) ²⁷	
Human cytomegalovirus	Yes Minamishima et al (1994) ¹⁶	Yes Hamprecht et al (2017) ²⁸ Moylan et al (2017) ²⁹ Prendergast et al (2019) ³	Yes, local cytotoxic response to CMV antigens Moylan et al (2017) ²⁹	Yes Risk reduction by pasteurization or freezing/thawing of breast milk Hamprecht et al (2017) ²⁸	Yes Rhesus monkey Kaur et al (2018) ³⁰ Antoine et al (2014) ³¹	Proven
Dengue virus	Yes Arrangain et al (2017) ³²	Yes Arrangain et al (2017) ³²	Yes Barthel et al (2013) ³³	Yes Absence of detectable virus in cord blood; infant breastfed by an infected wet-nurse Arrangain et al (2017) ³² Barthel et al (2013) ³³	Yes Mouse Lee et al (2016) ³⁴ Hamster Brueckner et al (1958) ³⁵	Proven

Zika virus	Yes Hoen et al (2018) ³⁶	Yes Dupont- Rouzeyrol M et al (2016) ³⁷ Sotelo et al (2017) ³⁸ Cavalcanti et al (2017) ³⁹ Blohm et al (2017) ⁴⁰	Yes Dupont- Rouzeyrol et al (2016) ³⁷ Sotelo et al (2017) ³⁸	Yes Vector-borne transmission non excluded but 99% genetic identity between breast milk and infant's strains Blohm et al (2018) ⁴⁰ Colt et al (2017) ⁴¹	Yes Rhesus macaque Newman et al (2017) ⁴² Bradley et al (2017) ⁴³	Proven
Ebola virus	Yes Sissoko et al (2017) ⁴⁴	Yes Nordenstedt et al (2016) ⁴⁵	Yes Bausch et al (2007) ⁴⁶ Logue et al (2019) ⁴⁷	Yes Transmission from an asymptomatic woman with long term EBOV shedding in breast milk Sissoko et al (2017) ⁴⁴	Model exists [Ferrets: de la Vega et al (2018) ⁴⁸] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Probable
West Nile virus	Yes CDC (2002) ⁴⁹	Yes CDC (2002) ⁴⁹	No CDC (2002) ⁴⁹	YES Vector-borne transmission non excluded but mother infected postpartum by blood product	YES Hamster Reagan et al (1956) ⁵⁰ Mouse Blazquez et al	Probable

				transfusion CDC (2002) ⁴⁹	(2010) ⁵¹	
Andes virus	Yes Ferres et al (2020) ¹⁷	Yes Ferres et al (2020) ¹⁷	Yes Ferres et al (2020) ¹⁷	Not documented	Model exists [hamster: Witkowski et al (2017) ⁵²] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Probable
Yellow fever virus (vaccine strain 17D)	Yes CDC (2010) ⁵³	Not documented	Yes Genetic identity of infant and maternal viruses CDC (2010) ⁵³	Yes YFV vaccine virus in CSF by PCR CDC (2010) ⁵³	No animal milk transmission experiment reported	Possible
Epstein-Barr virus	Yes Junker et al (1991) ⁵⁴ Daud et al (2015) ⁵⁵	Yes Sanosyan et al (2016) ⁵⁶	Yes Junker et al (1991) ⁵⁴ Daud et al (2015) ⁵⁵	Not documented	Model exists [rabbit: Okuno et al (2010) ¹⁸] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Possible
Hepatitis E virus	Yes Verghese et al (2014) ⁵⁷	Yes Rivero-Juarez et al (2016) ⁵⁸	Yes Reported in cows milk Huang et al	Not documented	Model exists [rabbit: Wang et al (2018) ⁶⁰] but no milk transmission	Possible

			(2016) ⁵⁹		experiment reported	
Chikungunya virus	Yes Gérardin et al (2008) ⁶¹	Yes Campos et al (2017) ⁶²	No Campos et al (2017) ⁶²	No Vector-borne transmission non excluded	Models exist [mouse, non human primates: Haese et al (2016) ⁶³] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Unlikely
Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus type 2	Yes Lackey et al (2020) ⁶⁴ Walker et al (2020) ⁸	Yes Groß et al (2020) ⁹ Costa et al (2020) ⁶⁵	No Chambers et al (2020) ⁶⁶	No Possible by respiratory, droplets; no higher risk if breastfeeding Walker et al (2020) ⁸	Rhesus macaque and marmoset can be infected by oral inoculation of MERS- CoV Ruiz et al (2017) ¹⁴ Not reported for SARS-CoV2.	Unlikely but Insufficiently documented
Herpes simplex virus	Yes Dunkle et al (1979) ⁶⁷	Yes Kotrionas et al (1999) ⁶⁸	Not reported	No Sullivan-Bolyai et al (1983) ⁶⁹	Several models exist [guinea pig, mouse: Kollias et al (2016) ⁷⁰] but no milk transmission experiment reported in animal.	Unlikely but Insufficiently documented
Hepatitis C virus	Yes	Yes	No culture	No	Several animal	Unlikely but

	Polywka et al (1997) ⁷¹	Ogasawara et al (1993) ⁷² Kage et al (1997) ⁷³	available	Breastfeeding not an identified risk factor Polywka et al (1997) ⁷¹	models exist [chimpanzee, humanized mouse: Berggren et al (2020) ⁷⁴] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Insufficiently documented
Hepatitis B virus	Yes Beasley et al (1975) ⁷⁵ Shi et al (2011) ⁷⁶	Yes Montoya-Ferrer et al (2015) ⁷⁷	No culture available	No Breastfeeding not an identified risk factor Shi et al (2011) ⁷⁶	Several animal models available [Guo et al (2018) ⁷⁸] but no milk transmission experiment reported	Unlikely but Insufficiently documented

* Proven=all 5 criteria fulfilled; Probable=4 of the 5 criteria fulfilled; Possible=3 of the 5 criteria fulfilled; unlikely= less than 3 criteria; insufficiently documented=at least two undocumented criteria